



# City of Aurora

2nd Floor Council  
Chambers  
44 E. Downer Place  
Aurora, IL 60505  
www.aurora-il.org

## Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

Thursday  
August 11, 2022  
7:00 PM

---

### CALL TO ORDER

### ROLL CALL

*The following Preservation Commission members were present: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, and Al Signorelli. Mike Walker called in and excused himself from the meeting and Kristin Ludwig was absent.*

*The following staff members were present: Mrs. Morgan & Ms. Burden.*

### OTHERS PRESENT

*Sundeeep Patel and Ken Gibbs (427 Pennsylvania Av)  
Ilyssa and Santiago Delgado (314 Blackhawk St)  
Daniel Brito Severino (356 West Park Av)*

### AGENDA

[21-0884](#)

Certificate of Appropriateness to allow three years to correct the violation of one vinyl window in the gable end at 465 Pennsylvania Avenue (Daniel & Raquel Vargas - 21-0884 / AU21/2-21.313-COA/HP - JM - Ward 6)

*This matter has been tabled until the next meeting as requested by homeowners.*

**This COA was continued to the next meeting date.**

**22-0629**

Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum soffits and fascia at 314 Blackhawk Street (Ilyssa and Santiago Delgado- 22-0629 - AU21/2-22.247-COA/HP - Ward 6)

*22-0629 Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum soffits and fascia at 314*

*Blackhawk St (Ilyssa & Santiago Delgado – 22-0629 – AU21/2-22-247-COA/HP – Ward 6)*

*Chairman Miller says okay, we can move that later. What about 314 Blackhawk? Jill, would you like to...*

*Mrs. Morgan says I'll just introduce it and bring you guys up (owners). So, they are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the aluminum on the soffits and fascia that was installed in preparation for new gutters at 314 Blackhawk. The property is in Tanner Historic District, built in the 1890's. It was covered in aluminum siding, having a closed porch, but in 2002 the house received a de-siding grant and a deferred loan that restored the wood shingles underneath and exposed the Craftsman style porch. This is kind of just giving you some background, so that's what was before. Then they did the porch re-siding to what it is, what it looks like currently. Then, here's some pictures from a phone on the current conditions. The house does not adhere to the design guidelines, B.2.17 Soffit and Fascia. Specifically, to meet the guidelines the applicant would need to repair or replace the deteriorated boards with similar wood. The owner stated that the soffits and fascia were deteriorated and damaged from animals and in preparation for the new gutters, the company they hired removed the soffits and fascia and installed new aluminum. Staff did stop by the site and told the contractors to stop work as wrapping wood soffits and fascia with aluminum does not adhere to the guidelines. The contractors did subsequently apply for the HCOA. Owner states that by the time the staff actually got out there to the site, the work was almost all done, and the original wood was removed. The owner is requesting to retain the aluminum soffits and fascia. Just as some background, when a similar request has come before the commission, it usually does deny that request on contributing historic resources. Some photos. (from owner)*

*Mrs. Delgado says those are from before and I do have a whole bunch there for you guys, if you need to keep them, pass them around. So, I have in the front are the before pictures and towards the end are the after the work was done, just showing all of the (inaudible).*

*Mrs. Morgan says so these were added, these are in your packet now, they were added after I originally launched it, so if you want to look into your pads more they should be in there now.*

*Mr. Hanson says are these pictures the same as these?*

*Mrs. Morgan says there's a few more in there.*

*Mrs. Delgado says there's a whole bunch more. There's only a couple in here.*

*Mrs. Morgan says here's some of the gutters. And then here are some of the pictures that kind of, during that initial stop work order. (inaudible) And then them going up. A better picture of aluminum going up. There again. And in the middle of the work. I'll give you guys a second if you want to look at those pictures a little more.*

*Chairman Miller says thank you for the background.*

*Mr. Hoffman says was the gutters the only part of this work? It wasn't part of a roofing*

*job or something that required a building permit?*

*Mrs. Morgan says no, it wasn't part of roofing.*

*Mr. Hoffman says okay, so just gutter work that didn't require a building permit, just an HCOA?*

*Mrs. Morgan says correct, just the HCOA.*

*Mr. Hoffman says so, no HCOA was filed for the work?*

*Mrs. Morgan says not beforehand, no.*

*Chairman Miller says I'll just read it into the record now since I've skipped a step. I usually do. Now we're moving up the agenda item. 22-0629 which is Certificate of Appropriateness for the soffits and fascia at 314 Blackhawk St. submitted by Ilyssa and Santiago Delgado. Were there any other questions for Jill on that?*

*Mrs. Morgan says now I can have the homeowners come up and you guys can continue circulating the pictures. If you could just sign in and for case, just put the address.*

*Mrs. Delgado says okay. Hi, so, we were just asking that, I mean, like Jill said, it's not very common for it to be accepted. We were newer, this was our first time doing anything, kind of like, to the house so I'm not sure how we have to go about the processes to this. Jill's been very helpful in guiding us and letting us know what we have to do. We did get the Certificate of Appropriateness for the gutters and the gutters were approved but when Leaf Guard came out, they said that they were going to be doing it all. They took everything down and already had taken everything away as far as all of the old soffit and fascia. When they had come out to stop the work, the first time they came out and wanted to stop work, all soffit and all fascia was already done and down. They were pretty much almost done with the job as far as that goes. They just had a couple spots, maybe, that they needed to put up and then it was going to be the gutters and they were done for the day. Jill did explain to me normally we would just fix the areas, which we did try to fix the couple areas if you see from some of the beginning of the pictures. There were squirrels coming into our attic, so we had put like wood over some of the areas to try to like stop that from happening and fixing it. But it just, they just still kept getting in there and then with the rain and everything our roof even started to get a little funny towards the end and the tips right there. I have the pictures from Leaf Guard from the beginning and I have the work after Leaf Guard. A couple of the pictures are better at the end of them that I did submit. They're actually not our home, they're actually some of the homes around our area, just kind of, I'm not sure what the process is for every neighbor but literally my neighbor right next to me got work done a couple, you know, 2 years ago, 3 years ago and has almost the same as us. Ones across the street with brand new windows and another one is with a brand-new roof and a brand-new soffit, fascia, and gutters as well. I just didn't understand the process for everyone. I'm not sure what else we have to, what steps we have to take.*

*Chairman Miller says I think I have questions for you. When you say the wood had been removed, you're saying there's nothing, there's just a metal sheet there, that there's, beyond that there's blue sky?*

*Mrs. Delgado says they replaced it with the aluminum, aluminum soffit and fascia. Leaf*

*Guard took everything down. So, when the inspector came out and asked them to stop work, that was already all done and down. Like done and gone, Leaf Guard took that away. There's a couple pictures that Jill has where they still need to put it up but they just had those couple areas that they needed to put the soffit or the fascia right there. Other than that, all soffit and fascia was already down and already taken away and put up the new aluminum soffit and fascia.*

*Mr. Signorelli says but doesn't that, doesn't the aluminum have to be attached to something? Does there have to be a board it is attached to?*

*Mr. Delgado says well they did replace, because the wood was rotting in the back, so they did replace that but it was just regular. It wasn't no specific type of wood. So, they replaced like the outline because it was rotting out and so they replaced all that and then they just drill it in, you know, they put the screws into it too. They installed the soffit.*

*Mr. Hoffman says just the front fascia board. Jill, if you can go to the images before pictures. I think this is maybe the during violation.*

*Mrs. Morgan says oh, the during violation.*

*Mr. Hoffman says you're right, sorry. Because I think that picture 3 shows, I think, what he's talking about like that. You're talking about the new yellow...*

*Mr. Delgado says yeah so you see how they replaced that wood. And then they underneath it there, they had took all the fascia off and then they were drilling into it and then they also used that same wood to put the new gutters on. To put the Leaf Guard gutters on. So, all that...*

*Mr. Hoffman says the soffit construction's a little different on the porch versus the main, the main part of the house is an open Craftsman style soffit so the finished bead board that they covered up, that's still there. That's part of that bottom of the roof deck.*

*Mr. Delgado says yeah so like, on the porch, we still have all the original, on the porch itself....*

*Mr. Hoffman says on the porch (inaudible). From the new pictures, I can't tell how much they would've taken off on the porch has an enclosed flat soffit rather than open to the bottom of the deck on there so I don't know what they would have moved but I suspect up on the top they usually take the bed moulding off they, goes between the frieze board and the bottom of the actual soffit bead board. They probably took some of that.....*

*Mr. Signorelli says that moulding may have been removed.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, that's kind of when they put the aluminum soffit track up, that's usually what they take off. Unless they, as long as they go down, sometimes they go down below it. So I guess it's hard to tell from exactly what the pictures.....sometimes they drop down below....*

*Mr. Delgado says it was kind of hard for us to plan because when we got there it was already, you know, it was done by the time we got there, they were like "alright". We were just stopped and they were already like "man, we only had like, an hour", they*

*had an hour left of work, maybe 2 hours tops. The only thing that was left for them to do at that time was just to put up the gutters which were approved.*

*Mrs. Delgado says well the gutters were not approved at that time because when Leaf Guard came, they told me that they did not need any permits in the City of Aurora. So, like I said, we were new to the process, we have been in our home for maybe 6 years and we've never had any kind of windows, soffit, fascia, anything, so when I did get notice right away, I went down and I got the Certificate of Appropriateness for the gutters. The gutters, Jill did email me back that the gutters were approved, just not soffit and fascia. Then when we did go to court, I talked with Jill off to the side and she let me know that if we could just fix those parts, but when they stopped the work everything was already done and down already.*

*Chairman Miller says I think repairs or replacement of deteriorated wood on the fascia behind the gutter would normally be permitted if that wood was rotted.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, and they're going to replace it the same if you're going to wrap it with aluminum versus the exposed, if it's exposed, even if it's wrapped aluminum it just hides it. It doesn't really protect it as much. But it would be simpler if you were, if you just had painted.*

*Mrs. Delgado says and I think I have, I don't know if it's in there, I did have another picture, it might not be, of the garage and you can see the wood. You see the long bar of the wood that they have and then they did the gutter in front of it. So that is wood, it's just not the original wood because everything was gone already. But I did try to show the pictures and the pictures, the original one, that's what Leaf Guard took themselves showing we did have, it was really bad and squirrels kept getting in there and we did keep try to like, fix it as best as we could. There was several spots where they were getting into.*

*Mr. Delgado says it was becoming a hassle and we thought we were doing the right thing.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, I see you're trying to take care of the house. As Jill said, covering aluminum, covering soffits with aluminum wouldn't normally be approved and I don't expect to approve this one either. It doesn't seem like a big job to remove that. The main part of the house, the wood will still be there. Some of that, if they removed some of the moulding and threw that away, that would need to be replaced. I feel bad that the contractor took advantage of you doing work that did not comply with local ordinances. I think they should be responsible for making it comply with the ordinances.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I would think so too. Will they own up to that? I don't know.*

*Mr. Signorelli says yeah, they have a responsibility to all the homeowners in the Historic districts, not just come in and do anything and they should already know that.*

*Mr. Delgado says yeah, and see they didn't, we, we were like, we just like told them that we live in this area. They were like "as far as we know, the City of Aurora doesn't need a permit" so we just like "alright" so you know, it just went on from there. And then, you know, Jill showed up and you know, she told us and then we went to go get the Certificate. You know, so, I mean it's just a tag team.*

*Chairman Millers says yeah, I'm sorry that happened to you.*

*Mr. Signorelli says and I would like to comment to you folks too. I know you said you showed us some pictures of some neighboring houses. There's a very good chance, probably, the probability is that those examples that you showed us were things that were done before there was a Historic district designation. So, yes, you see them and you said your neighbors have done these things but, like I said, it was probably done before the designation and wouldn't be allowed now. But it's there, I understand that. I would also like to say that looking at the before pictures of your house, I mean, what you've done is wonderful. It's wonderful.*

*Mrs. Morgan says it's from previous owners.*

*Mr. Signorelli says oh, that was the previous owners? Well, right now you have a house that's one of the nicest, one of the most prominent in the neighborhood and it's also a perfect example of its type of architecture. And specifically, on this type of architecture, with the kind of overhangs, the soffits and fascia are very prominent features and that's another reason why we would like to see them repaired rather than covered.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, they're a character defining detail for the Craftsman style that your house is. It's a beautiful house, it's one that I've always noticed when I go past. So, I didn't know that it had looked so rough in its past life, all covered over aluminum siding. It looks great there and this is one of those, the soffits are one of the details that make it such a, such a beautiful place.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I agree. The aluminum will need to be removed and the wood that was replaced that was rotten probably would've needed to be replaced anyway.*

*Mrs. Delgado says so, the wood that was rotten, it would be, that would've been fine, so what exactly do we need to replace?*

*Chairman Miller says oh, it would be to remove the aluminum and then replace...*

*Mr. Hoffman says and then replace, if they removed moulding or decorative details, they would need to restore those, basically, back to what is was before. Of course, the rotted wood needed to be replaced, but replaced in kind. Essentially with what the same, the fascia is simple flat boards, so I think the only concern here is whether they removed some of the decorative moulding. That way they'd have to replace that, that's generally still, like bed moulding is a standard millwork type so it should've been something real exotic but....depending how they framed in those soffits they may have just gone underneath, it may have been there. So, it may mostly just be removing what they put on top.*

*Mr. Signorelli says and I would hope that under the circumstances that those people would be willing to give you a substantial, some kind of substantial break or something for them not doing the right thing to begin with.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I don't think you guys should be liable for them doing non-compliant work. And they probably charge you extra to do all that soffit work, unfortunately.*

*Mrs. Delgado says it's already paid in full, all of it.*

*Mr. Signorelli says yeah, ok.*

*Mr. Hanson says so, with that, where's the City willing to jump in and say to a contractor that you didn't play by the rules and the homeowner, the property owner is getting the short end of the stick here?*

*Mrs. Morgan says the only thing we can do is if they do other work that requires permits, we have held on issuing additional permits. But if all the work they do doesn't require permits, then there's not really much the City can do.*

*Mr. Hanson says so far these homeowners were told that permits weren't required.*

*Mrs. Morgan says their contractors told them that.*

*Mr. Hanson says okay, and they performed work that did require permits. What's their recourse?*

*Mrs. Morgan says like I said, we can, if like, we can, I could talk to Building and Permits about holding....*

*Mr. Hanson says so, they're on the hook for now until these contractors do something again?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, it's a private property issue. I mean the City can't go to legal court with every homeowner that has a contractor that screws them over. It is a contract between....*

*Mr. Hanson says that's what happened, the contractor screwed them over.*

*Mr. Signorelli says I want that on record. (laughs)*

*Mrs. Morgan (laughs) says I shouldn't say it that way.*

*Mr. Delgado says yeah, we just thought we were doing the right thing.*

*Mrs. Delgado says is this, yeah, well, see, we have a court date because we went to court, you know, with the City for this and we were coming here to see how this would work only because we, you know, like I said, in my neighbors, they're getting work done.....*

*Mr. Hanson says so literally, literally we just said that the contractors screwed the homeowners over but you've got a court date with the City. Help me understand.*

*Mrs. Morgan says that is how contractors, homeowners contract the contractor, the City's not part of that contract. That's a private deal, I mean we're not going to go and start....the City doesn't have a legal standing to try to like, sue. That's a private property ownership matter, to sue contractors or go after contractors. The only recourse we do have, like I said, is we can hold permits and not allow them to issue other permits in the City. I mean, it would be helpful if you're a roof contractor and you do roofing permits a lot in the City, but if you're just like a gutter person that moves through, the City doesn't require a gutters....I'm not for sure what all work they do. Is this not....is this picture, it looks to me like the, is the original still not up in this picture?*

*Mr. Delgado says that, I believe, that's current work.*

*Mrs. Delgado says that was old. If it's the one on the screen, that's an old one.*

*Mrs. Morgan says no, this was taken by our contractors during the stop work order. It just looks like maybe there was not as much done as they might be telling you.*

*Mrs. Delgado says no, those are old.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, some of those, the actual physical pictures there, they showed wrapped aluminum soffit.*

*Mrs. Delgado says yeah, the fence is no longer up, we did take down the fence.*

*Mr. Signorelli says yeah, the fence is all gone now.*

*Mrs. Morgan says oh, maybe he just took a Google screen shot from it. Okay.*

*Mrs. Delgado says that was part of our thing as well. Taking down the fence because we did half up and half down. It was falling. But we completely got rid of our fence, you know, we take very good care of our lawn. We have landscaping, we have True Green, you know we thought we were doing the right thing. We got Leaf Guard, we take very good care of it and it just kind of....*

*Mrs. Morgan says okay, he must've just used an old photo he had of the house. And I don't recall when I was out there how much of the work was done.*

*Chairman Miller says are there any further questions? Okay, that's our discussion.*

*Yeah, thank you for coming. I live nearby and I walk by your house and I see you take good care of it. Maybe I shouldn't tell you I walk by in case you want to throw vegetables at me. (laughs) It's a lovely house and I've been around long enough, I do remember the old, old pictures when it looked, when it was horrible. I don't know if you've ever seen those before, but it looked bad.*

*Mr. Delgado says when we bought the house, they had a picture of the house and it had the original. Like the porch rail was all closed off, it wasn't opened up yet so, I mean, we had....*

*Chairman Miller says, yeah, thank you for trying to take care of the house. I'm sorry this has happened. But I think the aluminum has to come off. I hope it's not too big of a deal and the contractor should be taking care of that.*

*Mrs. Morgan says do we need a vote?*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, we need a vote on the COA.*

*Mr. Castrejon says just one question. Since this has court pending, is this something we can't vote on?*

*Mrs. Morgan says no, it's in Administrative Hearings, so yes, you can vote on it. They extended it for the Commission to see if they were going to allow a variation to the guidelines. So then, the court date, once that's determined, they'll probably do another extension to allow the homeowners time to address the violation.*

*Mr. Hanson says so, Chair Miller, the vote is going to be what?*



*Mrs. Morgan says someone needs to make a motion.*

*Chairman Miller says someone needs to make a motion, right.*

*Chairman Miller says I'm trying to get the right document up. I think it would be, we have to make a motion to approve the COA for a wrapped fascia and soffit or a motion to deny. Do we have a motion?*

*Mr. Signorelli says well, I hate to do it, but I'm going to say, I'm going to recommend denial of the COA for the aluminum soffits and fascia at 314 Blackhawk St.*

*Chairman Miller says so Al has a motion to deny, do we have a second?*

*Mr. Munoz says second.*

*Chairman Miller says is there any further discussion on the motion? If there's no further discussion, Sharon could you do the roll call vote for us?*

**MOTION TO DENY CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS WAS MADE BY: Al Signorelli**

**MOTION SECONDED BY: Simon Munoz**

**AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli**

**NAYS: Matt Hanson**

*Chairman Miller says the motion has passed. Thank you for coming in, sorry this is happening to you.*

**The matter to approve the Historic Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the aluminum soffits and fascia has been denied.**

## **22-0631**

Certificate of Appropriateness to retain vinyl windows that were installed without a HCOA at 427 Pennsylvania Avenue (Sundeep Patel- 22-0631 - AU21/2-22.248-COA/HP - Ward 6)

*Chairman Miller says next I see on the list, is there anyone waiting on 427 Pennsylvania Av?*

*We can make that our agenda item. 22-0631, Certificate of Appropriateness to retain vinyl windows that were installed without HCOA at 427 Pennsylvania Av., submitted by Sundeep Patel.*

**22-0631 Certificate of Appropriateness to retain vinyl windows that were installed without a HCOA at 427 Pennsylvania Av (Sundeep Patel – 22-0631 – AU21/2-22.248-COA/HP- Ward 6)**

*Mrs. Morgan says so the owner's requesting the COA to retain the vinyl windows because he was not aware the home was in a historic district and neighboring homes have vinyl windows. The home is in the Tanner District, is a contributing resource, was built circa 1890s. Here are some pictures, some before pictures to give you some idea of the before. The 2000 Survey noted 1/1 double-hung wood windows. The property received a desiding grant and a deferred preservation loan in 2005, so here is kind of the before some of the work. And then this is kind of after.*

*Chairman Miller says it's interesting they restored that front window.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes. And then there's some current photos. Per photos, the windows were originally 1/1 double-hung wood windows with the small oriel window in the rear appears to be casement windows on the south elevation. The owner is requesting to retain the vinyl windows because he was not informed prior to purchase that the home was in a historic district and cannot afford new aluminum clad wood windows. Owner states that he did not sign any acknowledgement or receive anything welcoming him to the district. Staff informed him that the City did pass a Historic District Disclosure ordinance requiring sellers to disclose that the property is in a historic district. The City is not required to send out notices since we do have that ordinance that the sellers should take that responsibility, but we do send out letters to homeowners once we get a transfer stamp that it was newly purchased. We try to send out letters stating that they are in a district and where to find the guidelines online. I did know that some of the surrounding homes might have vinyl windows that predate the district, but I also, they might be seeing some of the storm windows instead of the original wood windows behind the storms. As the Commission might be aware that we've approved some aluminum clad wood windows, particularly Marvin, Jeld-Wen, Pella as some examples. We try to look for ones that have similar dimensions to the historic windows, which those that were mentioned have. The homeowners are welcome to propose any other window with cut sheets and specifications. The new windows should be completely fill in the opening. It did look like some of the windows were not quite the right size and they kind of puttied in the surrounds. Staff would suggest allowing a two-year time frame as we've allowed that in other instance two to three-year time frame. Staff would also suggest allowing the rear window bay on the south elevation, possibly it's not so....so that very, very rear one....is not real visible. It possibly might be later addition, as well as the two small windows, kind of right back there, as kind of not super visible from the street.*

*Mr. Hoffman says on the second floor in the back?*

*Mrs. Morgan says on the second floor, yeah.*

*Mr. Hoffman says was there, I noticed it looks like there was a fair bit of work going on at this house. Were there other building permits pulled with the City for work at this address?*

*Mrs. Morgan says not that I know of but I can't speak for certain either way.*

*Mr. Hoffman says from the sales record it looks like it's been a flip in the last year so I would expect there to be a number of....it is currently listed for sale, so I would expect there to be a number of building permits for other work at the property.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes, I'm not certain.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, are there any other questions for Jill?*

*Mr. Signorelli says am I reading this correctly that some of the window replacements were replacing original 1/1 windows like the three next to the rear door and the stairs, there's three windows there.*

*Mr. Arnold says on the side of the driveway?*

*Mr. Signorelli says yes, on the side of the driveway.*

*Mr. Arnold says that looks like that was a more recent, probably, well that's another addition that was a newer bay window.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes, it was a little oriel with casements.*

*Mr. Signorelli says oh, so they weren't replacing that with 1/1s like the others then?*

*Mrs. Morgan says they replaced those casements with what you see here.*

*Mr. Arnold says yeah, that's a flat one right there.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, it's flat. I don't, I couldn't tell, I'm not sure which material but it was definitely a casement.*

*Mr. Arnold says that section looks like an addition over there. It may have had....*

*Mr. Hoffman says do you mean behind the side door?*

*Mrs. Morgan says in front of the side door, we all said that...*

*Mr. Hoffman says oh, that little bay that was on the very old picture?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, it's probably cracked is what we're talking about.*

*Mr. Hoffman says and that was gone before this issue, correct?*

*Mrs. Morgan says no, that was, they changed that out. That was, that's in the....*

*Mr. Hoffman says oh, just this summer the bay went out.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, I don't have a picture of it but yeah, that was still there in current Google images.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, you could see the little brackets are still there.*

*Chairman Miller says an unrelated question is would anyone be able to take this iPad back to where the Historic Preservation materials are?*

*Mr. Hoffman says I'm good enough at crashing this....*

*Chairman Miller says I found my way back.*

*Mrs. Morgan says any other questions for staff?*

*Mrs. Signorelli says is it the same deal then with the window in the front of, the picture window with the two little side windows?*

*Mrs. Morgan says so, the picture window is gone. So, what you had was this.*

*Chairman Miller says so someone, a previous owner removed the inappropriate picture window and replaced it with the side by side, and then recreated the window hood?*

*Mrs. Morgan says, yes and they got...*

*Chairman Miller says that was good work.*

*Mrs. Morgan says they got funding for that. There was a desiding and a deferred loan.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, yeah. That was good work.*

*Chairman Miller so, those windows, when was that work done?*

*Mrs. Morgan says 2005.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, so that set of windows was quite recent. The windows that were there.*

*Mrs. Morgan says, yeah 2005.*

*Chairman Miller says alright, any further questions for Jill? Thank you. Does the property owner wish to say anything?*

*Mr. Patel says hello.*

*Chairman Miller says hello. Can you state your name and address for the record, please?*

*Mr. Patel says Sundeep Patel, 427 Pennsylvania Av.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, thank you.*

*Mr. Patel says so, like Miss Jill had mentioned, when I purchased the property, I had no idea it was a historic area. I'm trying to invest in Aurora, this is my first flip. So, I went in and I hired a contractor, I do have the invoice which I forgot to send to you but on the invoice it clearly states that he would call the City of Aurora and obtain permits and let me know what that cost was. You know, I wasn't able to follow up with him to see if he did get the permit or not. I trusted him in obtaining that. But when Miss Jill came, that's when I found out it's a historic area. I had no idea. I don't have the finances because I know that in historic areas or an HOA that there are certain guidelines and regulations you have to follow to keep the property in a certain standard. I don't have the funding for that. That's one of the reasons why I in my appeal, I indicated that I would have never purchased a property just because I don't have the cash to do that. Again, this is my first flip and I'm just trying to better my financial situation with my family. And you know, with the vinyl windows, again, I saw vinyl windows in the area. But again, like you mentioned early, it could be like grandfathered in. I'm hoping we can keep the vinyl windows. They didn't case it yet, so I hired a new contractor, MIKK Construction. They do a ton of work in the City of Aurora, so I figured I'd hire someone local that knows the area and knows the rules and regulations. So, he is my new contractor too. We were hoping we can just case the windows in wood, if that's possible. But again, I do not have the funding to....I did look at the windows that Miss Jill sent over and they're coming out to \$350-\$375 a window and I do not have the money to do that.*

*Chairman Miller says well, thanks for coming. Yeah, I know this one is difficult. We had some others like yours and I'm afraid they got the same answer you're likely to get. It's like windows are such an important architectural feature. We can't leave vinyl*

windows in.

*Mr. Signorelli says can't you sue the contractor?*

*Chairman Miller says I'm a little concerned about a contractor actually saying they're going to get permits and not doing it.*

*Mr. Patel says I can, yeah, I have the, well I can show you the invoice if you want to pass it around. It clearly said if we need a permit, he would call.*

*Mr. Munoz says that's his responsibility. He should've followed through.*

*Mr. Hanson says the lawyers at closing, whether the seller's or yours, should have known about the historic district, and then the contractor should've known to get an HCOA.*

*Mr. Patel says and that's where I was saying, hopefully....*

*Mr. Hanson says you have 2 people that should've caught that.*

*Mr. Patel says so, I sent the MLS listing, I didn't know. I contacted my attorney and she said that if it was already landmarked that it's historic, that's when they would let me know at closing. But they followed up to see if there's any violations. There was one violation on the property but nowhere did my attorney even see, my realtor didn't even know that it was a historic area. Again, I don't have the funding for it. I mean, I can show you my bank statements, I have a family of 6 with little kids. I really don't have the money to replace the windows, and if we can even case it in wood, you know, to make it like the original. I have pictures of how the house looked originally, if that's possible, because they didn't case the outside yet. Because they stopped the work.*

*Mr. Arnold says you know, and the guidelines don't apply to anything on the interior of the house. It's just, so it's clear, it's only from the outside. Comparing the pictures, it appears these are smaller than the openings compared to the originals which is really the primary issue, along with the guidelines that generally don't permit vinyl as the material because it's not historic, historic material. So, I think casing these in would just kind of emphasize the inappropriate size for the frame. You can do whatever you want inside, the guidelines don't apply to anything in the interior.*

*Mr. Munoz says plus the windows, they look like they're sinking in, probably about an inch or an inch and a half further in from where they're supposed to be, surfaced with the frame. I was there earlier.*

*Mr. Arnold says yeah, these last pictures look like there were probably some storm windows on there that were either flush, flush-mount, or no, they might've been wood (inaudible).*

*Mr. Gibbs says can I speak? I would think they probably did that because the jambs are probably bigger than what those jambs are. Based on the fact that there was storms there.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, that could be one reason why we don't allow the vinyl too, the dimensions don't come out the way the original ones did.*

*Mr. Gibbs says okay, so what is a reasonable alternative for Mr. Patel so that we could*

*try to fix this and solve the issue.*

*Chairman Miller says I'm afraid there isn't one. The vinyl windows have to come out.*

*Mr. Arnold says I think like Jill did propose, some of them are not in a publicly prominent place where guidelines would be strict on the windows. So, anything on the back, and anything that's not at all visible from the public street is not beholden to the guidelines. Some of the sides, or the corners have some room for interpretation on what guidelines require, but the ones on the front are definitely not compliant.*

*Mr. Signorelli says now also if we give you, say, a multi-year time frame to put in appropriate windows, is there a possibility, Jill, if this gentleman could apply for the next round of grants and possibly get grant help from the City to help with that?*

*Mrs. Morgan says it has to be owner occupied.*

*Mr. Signorelli says oh, that right.*

*Mr. Hoffman says it's listed for sale now too now, so....*

*Mr. Patel says yeah, I took out \$80,000 in personal loans under my credit to try to start this and I'm kind of, you know, I was hoping, I just wish I never bought it. I didn't know. I'm just trying to you know....*

*Mr. Castrejon says Jill, roughly how many windows would have to be replaced?*

*Mr. Hoffman says there's 4 on the front façade*

*Mr. Hanson says so is that bay window, does that need to be a bay window, right? Or was that added after?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, I don't think that bay window was probably original.*

*Chairman Miller says I didn't really think so either.*

*Mrs. Morgan says so, I mean, I'm not, I don't necessarily think they need to put....*

*Mr. Hanson says I'm not sure what's even there. I don't know if it's the kitchen or a dining room.*

*Mrs. Morgan says so I don't necessarily think they need to, there is some siding that was moved above it that would need to be filled in but I wouldn't necessarily...*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, it seems, it had the little awning... yeah, I agree. That whole side, I mean this originally would most likely have had a little open porch tucked into the corner. There's probably another....*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes, I believe there's an open porch back in the rear on historic maps.*

*Mr. Hoffman says okay, yeah on the Sanborns. So, there was probably another set of windows inside that wall maybe that's been taken out. So, that whole side is kind of an accretion of additions.*

*Mr. Signorelli says yeah, so nothing there really is original, right?*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, so that bay window that was removed, in terms, if this was trimmed up, that would be, I think equivalently, essentially grandfathered in.*

*Mrs. Morgan says okay, so that back section sounds like Seth's saying maybe all of the first story on that side. You'd be willing to....*

*Chairman Miller says oh, okay.*

*Mr. Signorelli says I could agree with that.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I could too.*

*Mrs. Morgan says now there's also....I don't think I have a good picture of it.....there's a window also on the first story here that you can't really see on this picture.*

*Mr. Hoffman says behind that...behind that bump out?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah.*

*Mr. Hoffman says does that have the decorative hood over it.*

*Mrs. Morgan says let me double check.*

*Mr. Hoffman says that could be a later....(inaudible)*

*Chairman Miller says are we leaning towards....the 3 on the north side closest to the street, 4 on the front?*

*Mr. Signorelli says to be replaced?*

*Chairman Miller says yes, to be replaced.*

*Mr. Castrejon says so Amber and I are trying to figure out if we, if it's an option for you...the house is for sale now....to possibly make it as a disclosure or for the potential buyer to be responsible for replacing those windows. So, one, you don't have to replace them all while they're trying to figure out which ones must be replaced. But didn't we come up with that prior, like three years ago?*

*Chairman Miller says some other people have done that.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, we have disclosure form that a seller can, a potential buyer can sign saying that they are taking over curing violations.*

*Mr. Hoffman says those situations have been problematic in the past with buyers not fully understanding the existing violations that they're assuming responsibility for.*

*Chairman Miller says that could be, yeah.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes, we have had that too.*

*Chairman Miller says but I think we came to a solution with Miss Bird.*

*Mrs. Morgan says, yeah, we tried to be a little flexible with her.*

*Chairman Miller says so, it sounded like we're coming to, I heard 9. There's 2 and the gable on the south side of the house but the driveway and 4 windows on the front. And I think it's the north side of the house, 3 additional windows that are the closest to the street that would need to be replaced with windows that can be approved and that are the appropriate size. Is that what I'm hearing?*

*Mr. Munoz says so, then, 9?*

*Mr. Hanson says yeah, 9.*

*Mr. Arnold says yeah, so there's, so it's 8 of them that have the pointed hood, and then that one that doesn't that's on the west facing wall of the north side.*

*Chairman Miller says it's a first-floor window that's facing the street that doesn't, the one that doesn't have the decorative frame, that would be 9. And thanks for mentioning that as a possible option, selling that as a disclosure if you're unable to correct the violation.*

*Mr. Arnold says Jill, when that does occur, how does that document get included in closing?*

*Mrs. Morgan says I'm not certain, they signed and sent to me before, I'm not sure where in the process that's done. We also can do where we, if we know its being sold that way, we add a fine that we waive, but that way if someone comes and asks are there fines and stuff, and then they do the transfer stamp, that should ....*

*Chairman Miller says in the title search it should show that, don't you think?*

*Mrs. Morgan says not a title search because it's just a City fine. But if you come and ask about fines, plus if when you do the transfer stamp any outstanding fines have to be paid. But at that point they've already bought it but if they did any due diligence on asking about violations.*

*Mr. Signorelli says now couldn't you as the seller show the possible new buyer estimates that you've gotten for replacing with the appropriate windows and just pay the potential buyer that dollar amount in cash?*

*Mr. Patel says well, I've lowered the purchase price....but no one's....*

*Mr. Signorelli says but being the potential buyer I would think that "here's the cash to do the work"....done, you know, paid for. But either way, yeah, it's possible.*

*Mr. Patel says yeah, well I lowered the purchase price for it because of the way the windows are after I got the violation and no one's even put in an offer of anything on it. And so now I'm like nervous and scared that I'm going to sit on this and I only have, again, I don't have a lot of money and I took \$80,000 out in personal loans that the payments are hard because I'm only the sole income provider for the house. It was just a, it was an investment for my kids and my wife because, again, I'm one income and if I knew it was a historic area from the get-go I would've never bought it because I knew that if I do anything outside in a historic area, I wouldn't have the money for it. I don't have the cash flow for it. It's my first flip and I'm just, I was just hoping that I would be able to get approval from it because I had no knowledge, I didn't get a*



welcome letter, I didn't get any bylaws at closing, nothing. I went into this property not knowing it was in a historic area.

Mr. Arnold says there were no disclosures at closing? Did you close or did you have a representative who did your closing?

Mr. Patel says I, well, my attorney, I was at closing but I could show you an email I emailed my attorney immediately and said "hey, I got a violation that this in a historic area" and she wrote me back saying that there was nothing in their closing. And I can show you that email from my attorney. Like, I've been trying and trying to figure it out and I had literally no idea that I was purchasing a home in the historic district.

Mr. Signorelli says well, certainly your lawyer should've known better.

Mr. Hanson says and where is your documentation for your, frankly, your closing? I mean, saying you didn't know or no one signed off on it.

Mr. Patel says I have the closing package on my phone and I have the emails with the attorney saying that nowhere was it listed, and she said something that they only disclose it if it was an already a landmarked historic area.

Mrs. Morgan says it is.

Mr. Hanson says at closing there's a whole 5-minute conversation and signing papers in every house in the historic district, so I don't know. Someone didn't do their job correctly.

Mr. Gibbs says it's usually on the listing agreement, is that correct?

Mr. Hanson says well, no and then, yeah, it's.....

Mr. Hoffman says listing, it may or may not be in the listing, but it's legally required to be in the closing paperwork.

Mr. Signorelli says it's the law...it must be disclosed.

Mr. Patel says so she said, so I asked her on June 15th, I said "when we bought the house, did they say anything about in being in a historic area?" She said "they normally disclose it if it's a historic landmark, not if it's in a historic area. "

Mr. Signorelli says that's just stupid.

Mr. Hoffman says to save the confusion, in Aurora there's registered, there's designated historic districts so that all of the properties within district fall under the guidelines. There are also locally landmarked properties that aren't necessarily in the districts and those fall under the same guidelines. So, homes within district are subject to the guidelines even if they aren't specifically landmarked.

Mr. Signorelli says just out of curiosity, is this lawyer a real estate lawyer?

Mr. Patel says yeah, I mean she.... Hawbecker & Garver.

Mr. Hanson says so, the seller is supposed to disclose it so really, they're at fault. Supposing, if that's true? Correct?

*Mrs. Morgan says it's correct the seller discloses it, yes.*

*Chairman Miller says that's what I thought. I did sell a house in the historic district once; my attorney did provide that documentation to the buyer. So, I think, I mean it's a requirement for the seller to provide that. It's not a suggestion. It is City ordinance.*

*Mrs. Morgan says it is. Per City ordinance, it is a requirement, yes.*

*Chairman Miller says I'm sorry, I mean, at least my point of view, we still haven't decided yet, we aren't able to provide you what you want. I am sorry this horrible thing is happening to you. I would follow up with the attorney to see why, because the seller was required to provide that to you and apparently did not.*

*Mr. Hoffman says someone did not comply with Aurora ordinance.....(inaudible).*

*Mr. Signorelli says and you have to understand that on just as you have to follow the guidelines, we, in particular as this body, have to abide by the guidelines, abide by the ordinance.*

*Mrs. Morgan says and I did check. They didn't pull....there wasn't any other permits at this address.*

*Chairman Miller says so is there any other thing we can help or? I guess we got it down to 9, the 9 windows. Jill, was your recommendation include the others on the side?*

*Mrs. Morgan says I went either way. Originally, I just said the one on the rear but I can also definitely agree with the oriel, retaining that. I had thought that as well. And I also had thought 2 years. I'm not sure, if he's selling, if that helps but I know we've done that in the past, even sometimes I think we've gone 3.*

*Chairman Miller says so, I'm fine with that recommendation. Does anyone else have any comments, any other questions?*

*Mr. Hanson says so long as the recommendations are built into a proposal that we can motion on and vote on.*

*Chairman Miller says alright, so let me back up. Is anyone willing to make a motion?*

*Chairman Miller says I wasn't hearing anyone say they want to motion.....*

*Mr. Hoffman says I move that we allow retaining the vinyl windows except for the 9 locations that we discussed, including the 2 on the south gable façade, 4 on the street facing gable, the, looking at the pictures here, on the north, the ones on the north....*

*Chairman Miller says 3 on the north side closest to the street.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, facing the street.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, so we have a motion to approve the vinyl, approve the vinyl windows that have been installed except for the 9 that are mentioned. Do we have a second?*

*Mr. Castrejon says second, so moved.*

*Chairman Miller says Fernando seconded. Do we have any further discussion?*

*Mr. Hanson says yes, the time frame for...*

*Chairman Miller says oh, thank you. Why don't we amend the motion to include the 2-year time frame?*

*Mr. Hanson says I motion to amend.*

*Chairman Miller says thank you, a motion to amend...*

*Mr. Hanson says a motion to amend that repairs required are completed within 2 years.*

*Chairman Miller says will someone second the amendment?*

*Mr. Signorelli says I second it.*

*Mr. Hanson says first we vote on the amendment, then we vote on the motion.*

*Chairman Miller says oh, okay. I've never voted on an amended motion before. Okay, so we vote on the amendment to the motion. Sharon, can you call the roll?*

**AMENDMENT TO MOTION TO ALLOW TIME FRAME OF TWO YEARS TO COMPLETE WORK WAS MADE BY: Matt Hanson**

**MOTION SECONDED BY: Al Signorelli**

**AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli**

**NAYS: None**

*Chairman Miller says alright, so the amendment to the motion passes. And then can we vote on the whole motion please?*

**MOTION TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS ALLOWING ALL BUT NINE WINDOWS WAS MADE BY: Seth Hoffman**

**MOTION SECONDED BY: Fernando Castrejon**

**AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli**

**NAYS: None**

*Chairman Miller says alright, the motion passes. Thank you for coming in and thank you to, I forget your name, the contractor, for trying to help someone out who's in a bad situation.*

*Mr. Gibbs says oh, no problem. Thank you.*

**This matter was approved**

## AMENDMENT TO ALLOW FOR 2 YEAR COMPLETION TIME FRAME

22-0631- AMENDMENT TO ALLOW FOR 2 YEAR COMPLETION TIME FRAME

MOTION MADE BY : Matt Hanson

MOTION SECONDED BY: Al Signorelli

AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli

NAYS: None

**This matter was approved.**

### 22-0632

Certificate of Appropriateness to allow substitute material instead of wood for the Doric columns and Victorian style balusters at 356 West Park Avenue (Daniel Brito Severino- 22-0632 - AU21/2-22.249-COA/HP - Ward 6)

*Chairman Miller says and the next one, do we have anyone waiting on 356 West Park Av. ? Sorry it's been so long. We'll call the next agenda item.*

22-0632 Certificate of Appropriateness to allow substitute material instead of wood for the Doric columns and Victorian style balusters at 356 West Park Av (Daniel Brito Severino – 22-0632 – AU21/2-22.249-COA/HP – Ward 6)

*Mrs. Morgan says this is to allow fiberglass for the Doric columns instead of matching the current wood and the use turn-post balusters instead of matching the style that was on the porch. The property is in the Tanner Historic District, built circa 1904. The house is clad in aluminum siding and the 2000 Survey notes the porch is not original. So, here is kind of pre picture and here's a good pre picture of the porch. The side porch to the right, if you're looking at the house to the right, is similar columns and similar balusters. That's the current photos. The owner received a HCOA to repair the front porch and second-story stairs on the side; however, they ended up, actually, the contractors ending up beginning to rebuild the front porch, the west elevation porch, the porch on the right if you're looking at the house, and east elevation the steps leading up to the second floor. So, you're going to have a picture mid-stop. The staff went out, issued a stop work order, the owner's been in contact with staff trying to submit a Certificate of Appropriateness to adhere to the guidelines. Let me show you what they are proposing. The image to the left, this is the front. The front porch columns were thrown away, the owners cite when I did the stop work, the porch on the right side did have the original columns there. The owner is saying that those are deteriorating and do need to be replaced. I haven't done a detailed inspection to confirm that. The owner is proposing new fiberglass columns and then the balusters, I don't have pictures of that, the balusters were like your traditional, more turn post, which is what's on the second story steps. Oh, here we go. So, you can kind of see what they're proposing. Staff believes that fiberglass does not strictly adhere to the requirements of the guidelines and that's why staff is bringing it before the Commission. Staff will support the use of fiberglass material as the Commission has allowed it in other instances, and even recommended sometimes recommend composite materials in situations as that fact that modern wood does not have the longevity of historic wood, and modern materials can often, once painted, replicate the historic fabric. It also has been approved by the National Park Service on projects in the downtown that are pursuing Historic Tax Credits. I would note that in past comments, that Preservation Commission wants to make sure the columns were*

*tapered and not just the entire length the same size, which would be historically more accurate. Staff would recommend classical balusters, a little more like what was there originally, instead of mixing the very detailed Victorian, thin Victorian balusters, with the Classical column. Right now, staff is also recommending going ahead and retaining the columns on the east porch, even though it's not going to be an exact match, that are currently original.*

*Mr. Hoffman says you mean west?*

*Mrs. Morgan says the ones to the right side.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, on the Locust St. side porch.*

*Mrs. Morgan says unless the, like I said, I didn't go out to do a detailed inspection on the condition, if upon inspection, if they look like they are deteriorated, then I would support replacement in fiberglass as well.*

*Mr. Hoffman says or they could be repaired too. Usually it's just the bottom, it's just the pedestal or the bottom.*

*Mrs. Morgan says I would note that I will confirm that a wood frame will be placed around a lattice, that would lead typically to the steps so it will be one piece of wood, with the overhang being one inch and then chamfered so that step will conform, make sure it conforms to the guidelines, so it's kind of more of the details of the balusters and the material for the columns that need to go before the Commission. Are there any questions for staff?*

*Mr. Hoffman says I share your doubts about that statement of the porch as not being original. I would bet a substantial amount of money that those at the original porch are the original columns.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes.*

*Mr. Hoffman says even the half columns on the walls, if they're not original, it's very early.*

*Mrs. Morgan says I would agree, I didn't know where that came from. I tried to do some research to see, like did someone do a really great restoration job and I don't see that so I'm not sure why that comment was made.*

*Mr. Hoffman says the roof of that house has had some very bad things done to it, architecturally, which I understand from people who have been around here, that there was a fire there years ago. It might've been, and then, I don't know how they came up with that roof framing plan but that's very awkward. Because this porch is, and because the two match too. They have recessed gables on the sides. If you pull off some of the cladding, I think that you can confirm that those are original.*

*Chairman Miller says thanks for putting this together. I agree with your recommendations on the balusters and the columns. I guess what I'm missing is, like a plan for the roof restoration of the porch. The porch has been removed and I'm not sure what's happening with that. I see a deck there that's not appropriate. I'm not sure what's happening with that.*

*Mrs. Morgan says wood deck, it's just the floor.*

*Chairman Miller says the look on the front....*

*Mrs. Morgan says this was all there, this is the current footprint of the porch.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, but what's there is new. It's like there's a new deck and floor and it's not the original material.*

*Mrs. Morgan says maybe we can bring up the owner.*

*Chairman Miller says thank you for coming. Can you please give your name and address for the record please?*

*Mr. Severino says sure, my name is Daniel Brito Severino and we're talking about 356 West Park Av.*

*Chairman Miller says thank you.*

*Mrs. Morgan says what was your question, Dan?*

*Chairman Miller says what's happening with that, the new deck that was built on the front facing West Park? Inappropriate material.*

*Mr. Severino says I would like to start by saying that working with Jill is awesome.*

*Chairman Miller says oh, good!*

*Mr. Severino says and that you guys, the appreciation that you have and the vocabulary that you have of these different details, it escapes me. So, this is.... thank you. What's happening with the porch, and Jill has pointed it out, you see that we just have the columns and we don't have anything else. So, in some of the pictures, if you keep going to the right on the schematics that I put together, you'll see what I'm proposing for the top rail and the bottom rail and the balusters. The stop work was issued because we didn't really have the right columns, we were kind of doing it wrong. But if you go to the next one, you'll see that it's all supposed to be replaced with the right columns and in between them, rebuilding completely but accurately the top and bottom railing and then having the balusters in between.*

*Mr. Hoffman says there are some inappropriate details with the way the floor is currently built, so Jill, if you pull up the current photo, the flooring doesn't extend off past the front edge and there's an unusually wide band board crossed on the front of that. That's not appropriate either.*

*Mr. Signorelli says yeah, that doesn't look like it belongs at all.*

*Mr. Hoffman says the porch flooring should go in the short direction too and project past the edge which the original one....*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, the original one did. The tongue and groove floor. That would be perpendicular to the front door, projecting out to the street and then it would be slanted down just slightly so it shed water.*

*Mr. Hoffman says and with a narrower band and board crossed, if you go to the second picture of the original....*

*Mr. Severino says so, I have a question. Should I be taking notes so that I can provide those because I'm going to forget all of this, I'm so sorry. I brought some paper.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, and I can kind of outline, once we get to the approval of the permit.*

*Mr. Hoffman says the short version is what was there had, clearly had issues that needed repair, but it was the appropriate style. So, essentially what's built there new should look like what was there. So, that's the intent of the Preservation Guidelines is to maintain the originalness and this house has had quite a bit of work with the siding, everything's done before the Preservation, the historic ordinance was enacted in that neighborhood. So, there's a lot of stuff that's grandfathered in, the siding and that, we don't require that, you know, anything that's there to be changed but any work that's done has to follow the guidelines to maintain what's there.*

*Mr. Severino says okay.*

*Mr. Hoffman says do you have a contractor doing the work?*

*Mr. Severino says yeah.*

*Mr. Hoffman says because it does appear that they're building this like a backyard deck rather than a front porch, from the way that the framing that they're doing and that's why that looks off.*

*Mr. Severino says okay. So, you're saying that the wood we have there right now looks to you thicker than that one that was there on that picture?*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, if you look in the original picture, it's tongue and groove flooring that comes from the house, towards where the window and the door is out towards the street and it overhangs past that brown colored board. With the new one, it looks like they ran the, they ran long deck boards the other direction and then they have a....I'm not sure what that is, but it's got 3 grooves in it.*

*Mr. Severino says the other way around, the woods ends there instead of overhanging so, yeah, okay, so I get that. That's why it looks thicker.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, it almost looks like it might extend up past it or is it flush.*

*Mr. Severino says it's flush, it's flush.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I don't know if that's 3 five quarter deck boards butted or if it's....*

*Mr. Arnold says I don't think so, it's like a header or...*

*Mr. Hoffman says oh, like a header wrap or something? Okay. It was 3 boards put together there would be big gaps because it wouldn't be straight.*

*Mr. Severino says so, on the, we will definitely use 1 single piece of wood for the steps that will definitely overhang, they will be tapered. I need you guys' help with where to find.... I need to really understand what is it that I need to buy. Because, you know, like I said with my limitations I.... you have no idea how many hours it took me to put*

*that together. And I knew it was hugely inappropriate and inaccurate and I was like, doing my best. So, I need you to tell me, alright: this vendor, this person, this is who we use, this is who we recommend, this is actually called a triple-decker-double-whammy and I can absolutely go get that. But I don't know what it is that will make this house, you know, because it is a beautiful house. We definitely want to make sure that it's done appropriately.*

*Mr. Hoffman says the flooring material is standard stock...*

*Mr. Severino says it just needs to be taken off and done that direction, right?*

*Mr. Hoffman says it should be tongue and groove and I guess....*

*Chairman Miller says mine is like 2 inch or 3 inch wide.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, yeah.... tongue and groove.*

*Mr. Severino says so, that's what it had before, right? So, one would kind of go into the next one. Right? But it had buckled and so that's when they....*

*Chairman Miller says oh, so it needed to be replaced.*

*Mr. Severino says yeah, so when they went to replace it, because it was half rotten and half buckled, I guess the expansion and contraction....*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, porches lead a hard life. They're a 20 to 30-year kind of rehab so it was...*

*Mr. Severino says so they definitely, that wood is just wood. I know that they mentioned that they were having trouble finding the material and we kind of told them "look, I trust you" but they, that's definitely not tongue and groove for sure, which I'm learning that that's a thing right now.*

*Mr. Signorelli says well that's that little bit of overhang as well, right?*

*Mr. Severino says yes. Alright, so what should it be? It should be in the other direction, there should be overhang, do they need to be tongue and groove or should they not be?*

*Mrs. Morgan says the flooring of the porch needs to be tongue and groove but the floor, the steps need to be one piece of wood.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, that's correct.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, I think these steps, do you have a picture that's zoomed out a little bit more? I mean, it looks like, the steps don't look out of place, as long as they meet the rise and run requirements.*

*Chairman Miller says I don't think they have the overhang and that's actually (inaudible)...*

*Mr. Severino says they have like a quarter inch overhang.*

*Chairman Miller says a quarter....*



*Mr. Hoffman says I think that's a less significant detail in my.... for the steps themselves. I just did a quick look here for a local lumber yard and they have 1 by 4 treated pine porch tongue and groove floor in stock.*

*Mr. Severino says so, what's it called?*

*Mr. Hoffman says it's called porch flooring. It's 1 by 4 tongue and groove porch flooring. You can usually get it in either fir or treated pine, the fir is a little nicer, but the pine is usually cheaper, it looks like just a little bit. And I've used both with good results on projects of my own. But it called porch flooring, tongue and groove 1 by 4 porch flooring.*

*Mr. Signorelli says now as far as the stairs, since the stairs were already built, even though our recommendation would be one solid piece of wood for the step, which I don't know why you'd use 2 smaller pieces. But, since the stairs were already built and since that isn't a huge wrong, could we let the stairs stand as they are built?*

*Chairman Miller says I'd say no. I'd say we'd need to replace the treads.*

*Mr. Arnold says yeah, the treads need to be stair stock treads.*

*Chairman Miller says a stair tread is an actual thing you provide?*

*Mr. Arnold says yeah, it's thicker. It's almost a true 1 inch.... it's thicker, squarer.*

*Mr. Signorelli says and so then it would be 1 piece of wood.*

*Mr. Arnold says yeah.*

*Mr. Signorelli says well, okay.*

*Mrs. Morgan says and I don't know if those steps meet code, so they may have to rebuild those steps for building code.*

*Mr. Signorelli says oh, you mean the height?*

*Mrs. Morgan says the height.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, and they have to have a 1-inch nose? Three quarter?*

*Mrs. Morgan says I believe it's 1 inch per code.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I believe maybe it's 1 inch, plus or minus an eighth. I know there's a little....*

*Mr. Severino says so, I didn't get that last part. You said rebuild the steps and then something 1-inch code?*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, there's code requirements. Jill can explain those.*

*Mrs. Morgan says the step should overhang the riser by an inch.*

*Mr. Severino says yeah, I get that, yeah, yeah. Okay, okay cool. Question: how do I find out if the steps are or are not up to code?*

*Mr. Hoffman says that's in the building code requirements.*

*Mrs. Morgan says when you submit for the building permit, they will take a look at what you've submitted and tell you if they need additional information. They're probably going to need dimensions for everything. What the rise of each step is and they're going to need the height of the railings, the separation and how far the balusters are apart from each other. Your contractor might also be able to help you with that, making sure that you submit information and showing that it's going to be built to code.*

*Mr. Hoffman says you have a contractor that's doing the construction?*

*Mr. Severino says yeah.*

*Mr. Hoffman says if he doesn't know how to build code compliant stair dimensions, I would find someone else.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I would too.*

*Mr. Hoffman says because that's real basic. But if you're just.... that's just a standard building code just about everywhere across the U.S. so if you do a search for code stair dimensions, you'll find that.*

*Mr. Severino says he mentioned that he was doing it up to code. As a matter of fact, I think he did something with those beams. Where they go all the way down, because the one that he replaced, the reason why he threw it away was because you could touch it and it would just move. It was so rotten; it wasn't doing anything. And the other one was heading that way and you mentioned the bottom, what do you call it?*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, the pedestal. The bases.*

*Mr. Severino says the pedestal, it was coming off and you could see it's resting on the rotten portion that's already bending. And, you know, he went in there as a result of the inspection with the intention of repairing, and that's what I had originally submitted, and I put it, I filled it out saying repair or replace. Because he said "look, I don't know what I'm going to find" and I said "look, I want to do it right, if you need to repair it, repair it." I didn't know that I needed to make a distinction when one thing was going to be done, but that's okay. No problem. So, I need to submit the steps rise and....?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes when you submitted, did you submit the building permit?*

*Mr. Severino says on the second time around.*

*Mrs. Morgan says okay, so that usually, in those pages it has outlines kind of what they're looking for, what the dimensions for all the code stuff is.*

*Mr. Severino says okay.*

*Mrs. Morgan says and if you submitted it, our building examiner will take a look at it and let you know what additional information you might need. He might also probably have to come out, especially if you did foundation work. They're probably going to have to inspect that. You said that he connected the columns down and tied it into the....*

*Mr. Severino says I don't know if he tied it into the foundation, but he definitely didn't make it so that the column rests on the deck. The column goes all the way down to the ground and it's being connected to the deck and to the wood that you can see there on the bottom.*

*Mrs. Morgan says I'm thinking that would probably might require an inspection too.*

*Mr. Severino says so, since you're mentioning that, I did submit a building permit the second time around, but I don't know what triggers the evaluation of that document. Because when I check online, I see they're all in the same status. And I don't know if I need to do something.*

*Mrs. Morgan says I'll check.*

*Mr. Severino says thank you.*

*Mr. Hanson says there's a lot to be checked on here before we vote on anything. The question I have is regarding columns and as someone that works with or replaces columns, he talks about the materials being used and is that intended to be the finished product of the columns or....?*

*Mr. Severino says yeah, we would paint them so that it looked like the rest of the balusters. These that you can see here are the structure and the columns that we found, which by the way, we're only proposing those because those are the ones that we found with my limitations and assessing whether or not they will suffice. But I'm open to you guys' recommendations. But those are covers. You put them around, they're hollow in the square form and you wrap them around. It's actually called column wraps and it's supposed to look very nice whenever you paint them and install them. But I'm not married to that, that's just what I found.*

*Mr. Hanson says under principle, I guess, that's enticing to me because it's really a pain to rebuild wooden columns. But I just, I don't know where we stand in terms of code for this proposal and you mentioned that other entities have approved such things, and I know that we recently approved something for Mutual Ground and there can be a lot of sagging columns around this City very soon and it's a bigger question in front of us tonight. But I know that the wooden square ones don't meet code right now. If this is going to be approved for the cosmetic covering of those wooden posts, if they're structurally sound and the integrity is there for the regular building codes, then it's something we've got to look at in the bigger picture because we'll be doing this every single time someone is talking about doing their columns on their porch*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, I would agree. I would think I would like to bring some more updates through about some fiberglass and the other materials we'll kind of piece meal approve.*

*Chairman Miller says Jill, do you remember did we go ahead and approve the fiberglass column for the 78 S. View St.?*

*Mrs. Morgan says 77 S. View St....yes, they used a fiberglass column.*

*Chairman Miller says that's the one on the corner.*

*Mrs. Morgan says the one that was....*

*Mr. Hoffman says it used to be red.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes.*

*Mr. Hoffman says that's a really good point. Those are similar, I would check with, or maybe you could check with the supplier for those. Because those are some of the most historically appropriate proportions for these which is, there's a lot of ones that are not. There are 2 problems with the column wraps that you've proposed. One, if you look, and Jill if you could pull up the pictures of the original. The original ones taper down a lot more and that was typical for that style. A lot of the ones now, they're just straight, straight like a rod.*

*Mr. Severino says I spent an hour and a half online and they were all straight.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, those are the ones you find everywhere.*

*Mr. Severino says and then I found these that have, I want to say, a degree, if anything. And I said okay, I don't know if that even is being manufactured anymore because I don't find it. And so, I made sure that I proposed something that, at least in spirit, was heading that direction but I know that it doesn't do it in the same fashion.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah that house that Daniel mentioned, it's at the corner of View and Garfield.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, I can check to see.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, they're replacing because they had.... their original ones were long gone. And so, they're rebuilding their porch from some old black and white pictures and they found some. They're not fluted like yours here, but the other ones.... the supplier may have a series of them.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, they were a wrap too because it was....*

*Mr. Hoffman says were those wraps too? Okay.*

*Mrs. Morgan says I'm pretty sure, I think it was a piece of lumber behind that.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, there was something structural.*

*Mr. Hoffman says sometimes there are structural columns that are, I mean most of these are rated, a lot of them, are rated. Some of them are structural.*

*Mr. Severino says these are not.*

*Mr. Hoffman says they're a wrap. Right, I understand that. There's both versions.*

*Mr. Severino says there is something else you should know. I don't know if this picture shows it correctly. The are only, what's the word that you used to describe the grooves?*

*Mr. Hoffman says fluted.*

*Mr. Severino says after the railings, you see where....so those, I couldn't find them anywhere. And I know it's a huge difference. And I don't want to hurt myself, but they*

would look ugly in comparison to these. But the ones that are just partially fluted, didn't find them at all.

Mr. Signorelli says I've never seen them.

Mr. Hoffman says the ones that are partially fluted? They're not as common. And this, someone, well maybe Jill, is it in the records, somebody told me that this was a Minot designed house. See, he was a famous local architect.

Mrs. Morgan says really? I don't....I don't think I found that.

Mr. Hoffman says okay. I didn't know if that was in, this may be old neighborhood hearsay.

Mr. Signorelli says well, on that note.

Mr. Hoffman says that could indicate that there was a little more particular detail, you know when they were selecting, like these weren't custom made. They were out of a catalog, but they may have been looking at the more high-end stuff, rather than what was just at the Home Depot of 1895.

Mr. Signorelli says this is completely off subject, but I would love to see what underneath all that siding.

Mr. Severino says well, it's actually beautifully preserved. I mean, if you go, the house is immaculate in many regards. That siding doesn't have a single dent or scratch, it's very nice. I wouldn't be surprised to find that everything underneath is very well preserved.

Mr. Signorelli says it very often is.

Mr. Severino says yeah. Now, we have the benefit of the east side porch which hasn't been touched yet. So, we could definitely compare and go look, but again, I just need you guys to help me.... where? So, can I get in contact with the owners from the property, maybe?

Mrs. Morgan says yeah, I mean some of these details, I can still work with you on making sure some of these details, we can look at the columns. Look at 77 S. View to get more of the tapered. From the floor and stuff, I'll write all that down.

Mr. Hoffman says another person to check with is the Daniel Miller of Elgin. He's done a lot of, he's an old retired teacher, that does his own woodworking and stuff, and he's been the driving force behind a lot of the amazing porch reconstructions in Elgin Historic District. So, he might be, I know he makes his own columns sometimes to duplicate something that he probably would have. I can dig up his information.

Mr. Hanson says and that's a great idea except that what I commented on before was that there are porches all around Aurora that are itching, or because they want to make a repair and cannot because the coating or they're going to need to make a repair because it's going to collapse, and so it's time to actually review the possibility of these other materials than restoring something to what it used to look like a hundred years ago.

Mr. Hoffman says yeah, my suggestion, or my thought with him is he may have, even if

*you're a craftsman, it's always your first choice is to find something that's available. Mass production is widely....so he might have some sources for some of these more appropriate details. Because there are a lot of mill work companies that can do these sorts of specialty stuff, but they're not in Home Depot. That was just a thought there. But I think in terms of material, and that's the same, I think, discussion we had with Mutual Ground, reproducing the purest is really the intent of the guidelines. It's painted, whether it's wood or it's fiberglass, or a composite underneath it, I don't think is the intent of the guidelines, but it is shaped in the profile. So, if there are fiberglass or other composite non-wood columns, balusters, rails that may shapen the geometry.*

*Chairman Miller says I agree with that.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I think that meets the spirit of the guidelines.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah. So, anyway I want to get to what you need from us today, what I need from you. I think I need a view of what this porch is going to look like. At least the parts I see here are not prepared on the balusters and the columns. I think we've approved some fiberglass from other people. So, fiberglass columns is what needs to happen to get, the point being we want to get something as close as possible to what the original columns looked like. If push comes to shove, I'm probably going to yield on the partially fluted if we can't find that. And Jill, you mentioned balusters in a more classical design. Did you mean more similar to what was there to begin with?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, and I don't necessarily mean, I'm not saying going out and custom do a baluster but I think there would be other examples than just the thin Victorian....*

*Mr. Severino says so, let me see if I can show you.*

*Mr. Hoffman says original are also 24 inches tall rather than 36, which that has, you throw the tall spindly 36 inch on there and that looks really....I don't know the height of the porch and where the....*

*Chairman Miller says we can allow 24 inch in a Historic Preservation project, can't we?*

*Mr. Hoffman says I mean we should be. It's appropriate.*

*Mr. Severino says so this is what was there. I can try to look for those but....*

*Mrs. Morgan says something similar; it doesn't have to be exact but just something a little less than what you're proposing. I mean, I can work with you if the Commission agrees with me, so I can work with you on finding something.*

*Mr. Severino says, and I see the newel posts here are square but will we have before.....I'm not. Because it seems to be a larger topic like Mr. Hanson is suggesting, should I continue working with Jill on the different topics and whenever we have an agreement of something that we can put before you, we should do it again next month?*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I would like to see a proposal for the whole porch and thus far, hopefully we've given you some good helpful feedback that the....*

*Mr. Severino says I'm so ignorant in this that unless you told me "buy that" I'm still way too short on it, but I know that Jill can help.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, Jill can help. Is your contractor familiar with any kind of Historic Preservation work?*

*Mr. Severino says yeah, yeah, yeah....so, the thing is I didn't direct them because I didn't, I guess I didn't stress the importance of this. I don't want to say I didn't know because I did get a letter that the house was in a Historic District, but I didn't know what it meant. What I thought was what the gentleman from before, that discussion that came up which was there is every house here is historic and that I made a request to make this house historic. And so, that's what I thought that letter was. I thought that "hey, if you want to, you can make the request to make this house" and so I didn't think anything of it. But that's okay. It's not a problem, but anyways.*

*Mrs. Morgan says I talked to the contractors and I pointed out some of the stuff and they seem to understand what I was saying.*

*Chairman Miller says see, I'm the non-technical person myself, I'm not a carpenter, so I do rely on the contractors to lay out some of the details for me that I need to decide. So, I may not know it all, so it's helpful to have that experienced contractor to help where to find these materials.*

*Mr. Signorelli says and Jill.*

*Chairman Miller says and Jill, yeah.*

*Mr. Hanson says and some of that clarity went by the regular building codes, I mean looking at the original picture of the front steps versus the current version of the steps, they're not anywhere close to the width that they were before. I mean it's a little thing, but I think that some of it's going to get cleared up by having a regular building inspector, building code clarify what you need.*

*Chairman Miller says the width of the steps vary too.*

*Mr. Hanson says look at that compared to what's proposed...*

*Mr. Arnold says where is the picture of the new steps? I guess it's only a partial picture? Or it's not really showing? It should be hiding behind that column.*

*Mr. Hanson says correct it was flush with the column, the center whatever you want to call it, the middle of the innards of that column that was there before, that's 8, 12 inches.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah because the width they're built now, you'd need a little stub of railing there. Is was built up to fill that whole bay.*

*Mr. Severino says if you look here you'll see that it was also using 2 pieces of wood (inaudible). Maybe that's what they were trying to do, replicate it but what was there wasn't right.*

*Mrs. Morgan says right, yeah.*

*Mr. Severino says so, I have a picture where it looks like, what it looks now, definitely thicker but it's still 2 pieces of wood and it's still not overhanging, so the contractor was probably aiming for the same thing that was there and what was there wasn't*

*meeting the requirement.*

*I don't even know how all those horrible metal railings were ever allowed.*

*Mr. Hoffman (laughing) says yeah, those were definitely put up before the Historical ordinance.*

*Mr. Severino says those were crazy!*

*Mr. Hoffman says those were all the rage back in the 1950s and 60s. At least your columns weren't replaced with those. (laughs)*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, they would replace columns with those, the wrought iron. Anyway, so do we need to move on a COA?*

*Mrs. Morgan says no we can just hold it and we'll work out some of the details.*

*Chairman Miller says can we table the request?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, I just went ahead and brought it forward just because I didn't really know what time frame we were working with. It is a violation, but we can extend it while we're working through it.*

*Chairman Miller says and the homeowner is being very cooperative.*

*Mr. Hoffman says and there was an HCOA before the work, it's just the scope expanded?*

*Mrs. Morgan says yes, yes.*

*Mr. Hoffman says which is a lot better than some of the other cases where they don't even apply for the permit before they start the work, so I appreciate how you're working.*

*Chairman Miller says thank you for investing in this house.*

*Mr. Severino says we are definitely trying.*

*Mr. Castrejon says so, one commentary for Daniel since Seth is rubbing off.... Daniel? AmericanPorch.com, it's showing a standard height customized, you choose the fluting of it.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I've not seen that but there's mill work, there's kind of a couple different tiers of suppliers for this. There's the standard mass-produced stuff from the big box stores. The other end then, there's wood workers that do things pure custom, but then there's some of these smaller shops that use semi-custom. So, they have kind of standard smooth column, but then they can cut the fluting how you want.*

*Mr. Castrejon says so, it's a standard column, tapered, and then you customize the fluting.*

*Chairman Miller says thanks Fernando, I learned something new.*

*Mr. Severino says I didn't even know what to put in online, honestly. Like beveled or grooved or....this is all brand new.*



*Mr. Arnold says doesn't anybody have any older pictures of this house? Is there not an attic?*

*Mr. Severino says there is an attic.*

*Mr. Arnold says is it very, very short?*

*Mr. Severino says very, very short.*

*Mr. Arnold says don't you think this should have a really steep pitch?*

*Chairman Miller says that roof is not original.*

*Mr. Hanson says that whole roof must've caught on fire.....they built this low pitch, because it's so awkward.*

*Mr. Hoffman says it would've looked more like the house kitty corner.*

*Mr. Hanson says I guess it would've been like a big peak.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, I mean, it's a big Queen Anne with a steep, steep hip roof.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, like across the street from you on either side of Penn. Or the north side of West Park, there's 2 Victorians there with the steeply pitched roof. And I would guess your house would have that, I mean it looks like one...*

*Mr. Arnold says you'd think it would be the peak would be taller than the turret. I would think, usually.*

*Mr. Hanson says I'm not suggesting you change your lifestyle, but do you utilize the staircase.... I'm directionally challenged here, off the porch toward the driveway?*

*Mr. Severino says this is a rental home and I do not use it but there is a unit right there that is their daily in and out.*

*Mr. Hanson says okay, I see. Okay. My guess is that is original, but my guess is that both staircases have to come into compliance and I just didn't know if that was needed at all.*

*Mr. Severino says so that staircase, again, we made work on it, but it was just the steps. Because they were, I don't know how to describe it, if you stepped on one side it would come off, so whoever did the installation they didn't keep it up. When we bought the property, the first thing we did was remove those steps and put in new steps. But we did the exact same thing that was there. It was 2 pieces of wood, so we did it like for like.*

*Mr. Signorelli says I'm just kind of curious. Have you ever checked with the Aurora Historical Society to see if they might have any early pictures of your house?*

*Mr. Severino says no, I haven't. That's a very good idea.*

*Mr. Signorelli says it might be something you might want to find out.*

*Mrs. Morgan says alright, so do we just want to table this, and we'll continue to work on*

*it?*

*Chairman Miller says okay, yeah. Do we need a motion to table?*

*Mrs. Morgan says no.*

*Mr. Hanson says so, the very last question for you, sir. So, the intent is to keep it as a multi-unit residence?*

*Mr. Severino says yeah.*

*Mr. Hanson says okay, thanks.*

*Mr. Severino says thank you, thank you so much.*

*Chairman Miller says thank you for coming, really. It was a pleasure to meet you.*

*Mr. Severino says same here. Bye, have a good evening.*

**This COA was continued to the next meeting.**

**22-0628**

Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 4-foot wood fence in the front yard at 2888 N. Eola Road (Michael Walker - 22-0628 - WI32/4-22.246-COA/HP - Ward 10)

*Chairman Miller says let's see here....*

*Mr. Signorelli says 2888 N. Eola. Mike's place.*

*Chairman Miller says well, that's an easy no (laughs).*

*Mr. Castrejon says are you voting no, already? (laughs).*

*Chairman Miller I guess we still have some items on the agenda. We can get through the next ones quickly. If we call up, well, at the top of our agenda was 21-0884, Certificate of Appropriateness to allow 3 years to correct the violation.*

*Mrs. Morgan says we're just going to hold it.*

*Chairman Miller says we're holding it?*

*Mrs. Morgan says she's going to be here next month.*

*Chairman Miller says okay. So, we can go to 22-0628. Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 4-foot wood fence in the front yard at 2888 N. Eola Rd. submitted by Michael Walker.*

*Mrs. Morgan says, yes, the property is a Local Landmark, it was built circa 1837. In general, they're seeking to replace the current 4-foot fence in the front yard that is damaged with a new 4-foot tall wood scalloped spaced picket dogear fence. So, it's similar to what is there now. The current fence is in disrepair, this site is a Local Landmark and not part of a district and sits on a much larger property than found in the historic districts. There is no sidewalk on that side of Eola, so the only sidewalk is on the other side of Eola, so a tall fence doesn't appear to hinder the visibility to the house when you're all the way on the east side of Eola, which is a hundred feet away.*

*It is not set in a residential neighborhood, large lot size, so staff believes a 4-foot fence would not negatively impact the historic character of the house and would adhere to the intent of the Guidelines.*

*Mr. Hoffman says so what differs from the specific details of the....is it the height?*

*Mrs. Morgan says the height. It would only be allowed a 3 ½ foot open; 3 foot solid, 3 ½ foot open.*

*Mr. Hoffman okay, I was thinking like 4-foot, that seems short enough to me, but okay 3 ½ foot, okay.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, so comes to 6 inches.*

*Mrs. Morgan says we've had a lot of this, even in other lots in the Historic District that are even within the Historic District on larger lots.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I was about to mention that we have allowed minor variances to that in the past so if Mr. Walker thought he had to serve years on this Commission to get a variance for 6 inches on a fence, well the joke's on him. He didn't have to (laughs).*

*Mrs. Morgan says and Mr. Walker isn't present, just to put it out there.*

*Chairman Miller says Mr. Walker is not present and will not be voting on this COA.*

*Mr. Hoffman says and there's a lot more elevation change here too, than there is in a typical City lot, so that 6-inch difference is quite easily made up by walking, if you walk 2 foot in one direction or the other.*

*Mr. Signorelli says I was just going to say I have no trouble recommending approval of this, if nobody else has any questions.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, I would even mention one property I can remember at the northeast corner of West New York and Blackhawk that we gave a variance for an extra 6 inches.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I think just even in the spirit, the being a farmhouse out in Eola, I don't know the standard interior lot line, front, rear, like you say, there's not even a sidewalk there. Okay, I see this, I think of the, I think it's in Wizard of Oz, this little fence with the gate in front of the house. Am I picturing that right or is that something else? That's fine. I think it's entirely appropriate for the setting of this property.*

*Chairman Miller says any further questions or discussion?*

*Mr. Hanson says just a quickie; at some point I think it's worthwhile discussing the materials that are acceptable for fence replacement. It is very cost prohibitive to do that, even my little place, much less that big place for all wooden fencing. Just a consideration.*

*Mr. Hoffman says and the guidelines allow metal.*

*Mrs. Morgan says decorative metal.*

*Mr. Hoffman says decorative metal, right. Not chain link.*

*Mr. Signorelli says well, that will be even more expensive.*

*Mrs. Morgan says preferable is wood picket. But not like cast iron. I mean, I would accept an aluminum metal fence with some decoration, not such a commercial looking top rail, like, I think the one we did on New York was also.....*

*Chairman Miller says it's aluminum.*

*Mrs. Morgan says aluminum with more pointy tops, a little more decorative.*

*Chairman Miller says yeah, so it's more decorative, yeah.*

*Mr. Hoffman says Matt, are you referring to synthetic?*

*Mr. Hanson says I would love to that in the discussion for sure.*

*Mr. Hoffman says the synthetic that's meant to look like wood.*

*Mr. Arnold says what do they have besides vinyl? Is there like decks, like composite?*

*Chairman Miller says this sounds like Matt is volunteering to start a sub-committee (laughs).*

*Mr. Hanson says I'm sure it won't take long. I could find about a catrillion people in about half an hour they'll say "yeah, we'd much rather have this as an option versus the expensive wood" but I guess it's worth a discussion.*

*Mr. Signorelli says that would be a hard sell for me.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I think we're getting off track here. I think we're investigating what's there now that appropriately mimics the look. Because that's the big difference between vinyl siding and wood siding. It looks totally different walking past the street, if there are...the vinyl stuff....*

*Mr. Hanson says well, walk slower, I guess. I don't know.*

*Mr. Hoffman says the vinyl fences, I think, they look like a plastic Barbie house but maybe I haven't looked at it enough.*

*Mr. Hanson says and 10 years later they still look like a nice fence that's in compliance versus one that's not.*

*Mr. Signorelli says well, that's fine if you want that, but then don't put it around a historic house.*

*Mr. Arnold says I would think that to get it to look like wood, it's going to cost more than wood. It holds up longer than.... I don't know if it's available in fencing. I've never seen it.*

*Mr. Signorelli says I never have either, but I mean that is something to say for that it's probably going to last forever, although I think that after some years it does kind of fade but it wouldn't obviously rot. But I certainly wouldn't want plastic fencing of any*

*kind.*

*Mr. Hanson says well, anyway, it's worth the discussion because it's either no fencing or....*

*Chairman Miller says I'm fine with no fencing. Anyway, the meeting is running long. I wonder if we have a motion on the COA.*

*Mr. Signorelli says I move that we approved the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 4-foot wood fence in the front yard at 2888 N. Eola Rd.*

*Chairman Miller says we have a motion by Al Signorelli, do we have a second?*

*Mr. Castejon says second.*

*Chairman Miller says alright, Fernando Castrejon. Any further discussion? Okay, Sharon, could you call the roll?*

*Motion to Approve Installation of 4-foot wood Fence at 2888 N. Eola Rd.*

*Made by: Mr. Signorelli*

*Motion Seconded by: Mr. Castrejon.*

*AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli*

*NAYS: None*

*Chairman Miller says the motion passes. If we jump back up to the beginning of our agenda, the approval of the minutes. Do we have a motion to approve the minutes of June 16th?*

**This matter was approved**

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**22-0501**

Approval of the Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission meeting on June 16, 2022.

*MOTION OF APPROVAL WAS MADE BY: Al Signorelli*

*MOTION SECONDED BY: Simon Munoz*

*The motion carried by voice vote.*

**A motion was made by Mr. Signorelli , seconded by Mr. Munoz, the minutes be approved and filed. The motion carried by voice vote.**

### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

## COA REPORT

[22-0635](#)

June 2022 Historic Certificate of Appropriateness

*Chairman Miller says and then we have 2 months of COA reports. Do we have any questions for staff on those? I think there's a typo on the second page of the June, and it's for, it's the bottom one, 418 E. Downer Pl. That looks like it's the same description as the pool and fence.*

*Mrs. Morgan says okay, yeah. It's tuckpointing.*

*Mr. Hoffman says I could almost predict exactly what that text said.*

*Mrs. Morgan (laughs) yes, I will try to fix that.*

*Chairman Miller says I don't know if that's just something that's in this report that's outputted or if that's propagates elsewhere in the system.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, the correct thing would be in the system itself and I...*

*Mr. Hoffman says do these generate automatically, like the reports that you have...*

*Mrs. Morgan says the comments don't. I do hand....*

*Chairman Morgan says you have to copy, control, C, control...*

*Mrs. Morgan says there is a way to bring them in but it's a complicated report and we're still figuring that out, and this one is not the highest on the list of reports to do. So, that one I copy and paste. It's right in the system.*

*Chairman Miller says it's painful when it's on a big one here. Any other questions? Comments?*

*I see some of the grants, grant work coming through. There's a few window restorations.*

*Mr. Hoffman says yeah, that was good. I thought I saw some addresses that were grant recipients, some addresses on the east side which I thought was good.*

*Chairman Miller says is there anything else on June or July? June was a big month.*

*Mr. Hanson says thank you for the report. Just out of curiosity, we approved these grants, a lot of them were partially funding a bigger project. Did anyone say "no, thank you. I'm not going to proceed with the work" because it would only partially funded?*

*Mrs. Morgan says no, they didn't. A couple of them tried to figure out if there was elements that they could either do themselves or have a friend help them with to bring down the cost. Then, we also, I think you maybe missed that meeting; one of the grant recipients had a death in the family, one of the owners, and they can't accept the grant. So, we ended up taking that money and divvying it up between the partially funded. They all got \$2000-3000 more, that almost funded a couple of the smaller ones. The*

*bigger ones are still kind of partially funded.*

*Chairman Miller says and we also gave a little bit more, additional cash to the larger ones.*

*Mrs. Morgan says yeah, they got \$3000 and the smaller ones got \$2000.*

*Chairman Miller says it was a fully funded \$20,000 grant (inaudible) I'm glad we were able to provide some additional funding for those. Okay, is there anything else? Okay. Is there any other business for this meeting?*

*Mrs. Morgan says the only thing, I'm just going to past them out, I did the violation reports, active violations as well as the ones that have been closed since the last time I did the report, which I believe was at the March or April meeting. So, if you want to take a look at them. If you have any questions, email me or we can discuss it at the next meeting.*

*Chairman Miller says okay, I'd love to go through that. If you could hand those out, and then while Jill is providing our party favors, could we have a motion to adjourn the meeting?*

[22-0636](#)

July 2022 Historic Certificate of Appropriateness

## ADJOURNMENT

*Chairman Miller said do we have a motion to adjourn?*

*MOTION TO ADJOURN WAS MADE BY: Al Signorelli  
MOTION SECONDED BY: Fernando Castrejon*

*The motion carried by voice vote.*

*Chairman Miller adjourned the meeting at 8:55 p.m.*

**This meeting was adjourned by Chairman Miller at 8:55 pm.**

**VISIT OUR WEB SITE FOR CURRENT AGENDAS:**

**<https://www.aurora-il.org/AgendaCenter>**