



City of Aurora

2nd Floor Council
Chambers
44 E. Downer Place
Aurora, IL 60505
www.aurora-il.org

Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

Thursday

October 13, 2022

7:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Miller called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

The following Preservation Commission members were present: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli, and Mike Walker. Kristin Ludwig arrived at 7:05 p.m. Matt Hanson left at 8:05 p.m.

The following staff members were present: Mrs. Morgan & Ms. Burden.

OTHERS PRESENT

*Valerie Olafson (Illinois Historic Preservation Agency)
Daniel Severino (356 West Park Av)
Lucia Sanchez (452 Pennsylvania Av)*

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

22-0814

Approval of minutes from September 15, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

A motion was made by Mr. Castrejon, seconded by Mrs. Foster, that the minutes be approved and filed. The motion carried.

COA REPORT

22-0825

September 2022 Historic Certificate of Appropriateness Report

*Chairman Miller said are there any questions or comments about that?
Mr. Hoffman said what is the porch on 436 Blackhawk St.? New wood porch and handrails around concrete stoop. Is that a little side entry, side stairs or something?*

Mrs. Morgan said I'm sorry, I don't recall. I can follow up with you on that.

Mr. Hoffman said okay. It just says new porch, I was just curious.

Chairman Miller said so are there any other questions on this? No further questions or comments? We could move on to the agenda item 22-0821. That would be the comments on the National Register nomination of the Aurora Broadway Historic District.

Mrs. Morgan said I'm sorry....Seth, 436 Blackhawk, look at the picture, no it's that front, the front little steps going up to the porch.

Mr. Hoffman okay. So, they're just building a wood stair and porch with the same extents?

Mrs. Morgan said yes.

Mr. Hoffman said okay.

Mrs. Morgan said it'll match the railing and I think it's a simple newel post and balusters. Yeah, and they'll do a more simple, square newel post baluster. Kind of keeping it simple.

Mr. Hoffman said oh, is this the stairs up to the front porch?

Mrs. Morgan said yes.

Mr. Hoffman said oh, okay. I'm looking at this.....it's just a little precast with metal railing. Okay, so it's the stairs to the...okay. Makes sense.

Mrs. Morgan said alright, sorry Dan.

Chairman Miller said thanks for asking that question.

Mr. Hoffman said thanks for that clarification.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

AGENDA

22-0821

The Preservation Commission is providing comments on the National Register Nomination for Aurora Broadway Historic District (Illinois Historic Preservation Agency- 22-0821- AU22/3-22.280-HP - HP -JM - Ward 6)

Mrs. Morgan said alright, so for the National Register District, I'm just going to hand it over to Valerie who did the nomination. I'll let her go through everything for you.

Ms. Olafson said thanks Jill. Hello. My name is Valerie Olafson and I am a preservation consultant from Rockford and Pam Hind and I put together the nomination for the Broadway Historic District. It's been a long road, we're so glad we're here, and we'll be presenting to the State on October 28th. This is the outline of the district. You can see it sits on the east side of the river, the red outline here, so the border....

it's east of the river, the north border is New York which includes the properties on the north side of New York, and then the south border is Benton. This is a highlight which demonstrates that there are very few non-contributing buildings. So, the non-contributing buildings are the ones in pink. And many of those with some improvement can actually be switched from non-contributing to contributing. The mass of the district is contributing. There is only one that is listed on the National Register and that is the Hotel Arthur that was built in 1905 by Malmer. The period of significance is 1840 to....oops, typo....1970. Good thing I caught that before I go to the State, 1970. And we actually had it earlier and the district was smaller and then once we met with the State, we did a walk through with the State here, they really wanted to include the City building and the modern buildings because they're really stunning and they are just inside the mark, so that's why we extended it to 1970 to include those buildings. So, it's a wide range but you really see the development from late 19th century to mid-20th century architecture in the district. So, it's under Criterion A because it's also a business district. You have hotels, you have banks, you have retail, and then you have government. So, it's really integral to the social history of the City of Aurora. And then, architecture because, again, we see the architecture from the late 19th century all the way to the mid-20th century. And this building, this is the Elmslie, which we were both surprised that is wasn't already in the National Register singularly listed. But now, we'll be protected, and they just finished a beautiful restoration on that. The Hotel Arthur, this is the one that is singularly listed on the National Register, and again, they just did....well, they're in the midst, I should say, of a restoration on that. I came earlier today to take a new picture, so when I present this to the State, the scaffolding will be gone. At the northern boundary, one of the anchors is the Dillenburg block. This is a 1912 historic photo of the building which is Tudor Revival and it's really a lovely building. We both fell in love with that building, especially when you look at some of the detail. Like this is the entry gate and the fire escape around the delivery entrance. They just don't build them like that anymore. But this is the delivery entry on New York. And then, of course, the other anchor at the north end is the Aurora Fire Museum, which they did a beautiful restoration on this, and again we were surprised it wasn't singularly listed on the National Register. This, of course, was by Minott in 1894. The integrity of Broadway, this is the east side, there is very little infill. And some of the buildings, and almost throughout the United States, you're going to see the first floor altered. It was done like crazy in the 1950s, so there are very few intact, but even on Broadway we do have some intact first floor entries to the retail. But you see a lot of Italianate buildings and there's a lot of Classical Revival buildings as well as Commercial Block buildings. This is Broadway on the east side and Broadway on the west side and it is so intact, which is one of the things the State really liked about the district, is there wasn't a lot of, especially on this block, a lot of as we call "missing teeth". And Galena and Broadway really serves as a focal point then at the center of the district. On the northeast corner is this commercial style building that also has the Prairie element. And on the northwest corner is the aforementioned Hotel Arthur. The Elmslie Building sits on the southwest corner of the block, and again, then the National Bank is on the southeast corner. This was built in 1926, Classical Revival, and again I took another picture today that I'm going to swap in because this is just unsettling. You just feel like you've got to lean back to look at this photo so for this State I took one from the opposite corner, so we'll have a full picture of the building. Water Street, which is where we are right now, is a wonderful example of we watch like the development of late 19th and 20th century architectural along the block. And it's so nice that's now a pedestrian mall, and really used. Some of the things that have changed have just been really wonderful beautifications. But you see Italianate to Commercial style and then, of course, the modern part that we're in now that you can see right in the middle of the block. And then, of course, it ends with City Hall which was built in the Commercial style in 1924, and of course, then

again, there's Prairie elements in this building as well. The Coulter Opera House, which is now a bank, was built in the Classical Revival style and is an excellent example of that style and is also in excellent condition. One of the buildings that we found that was a little surprised that it just sits kind of tucked in behind the Coulter is this beautiful little Art Deco tile, or sorry, Art Deco terra cotta clad 2-story building. We just love doing districts because you always find these little gems that just all of a sudden pop up out of nowhere. Anchoring the southern border of the district is the modern City building which was built circa 1960 and this is on the northwest corner of Broadway and Benton. And then the other anchor at the south end is the 1924 Commercial style Flat Iron Building. The integrity of the district is strong, and we are asking for your support when we present to the State Committee on the 28th of this month. Thank you. I'll try to answer any questions you might have.

Mrs. Ludwig said I just have one quick question. So, would this proposal, you know, one of the fears I think has been in the Water Street Mall, these are all City owned buildings and the rumor has always been that there's an intention to level all this at some point and build a new City Hall campus here, so would this provide protection on these particular buildings?

Ms. Olafson said well, what the National Register does is, in the district, any building that is contributing then the owners can have protection. They can apply for tax credits so they can use other Federal programs that are available to them. If someone does not want to use those, they can actually tear their building down. The way to protect it is through local ordinances, like in Rockford, I sit on the Preservation Commission in the City of Rockford, and we have local districts and our local Commission has a lot more teeth than the National Register. That would be a City decision and not a State or Federal decision.

Mrs. Ludwig said okay, so this then, being part of a historic district, it won't....

Mr. Signorelli said not National Register have to be, we would have to make it....local would have more teeth, but the National Register does give it a certain status and respectability and it can be an issue when somebody tries to tear down a National Registered building.

Ms. Olafson said right, it can. It can come up before review because some other people, you know, people in the area and in the district can bring it up for review. A lot of times too, what will happen is if there's a National Registered district, it will often, they will use the same nomination then and then just apply it for local as well.

Mrs. Ludwig said and maybe it would free up some other types of funding to even repair some of these buildings that, right now, the roofs are you know....

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, this is part of the FoxWalk Overlay which, so any demolition within the FoxWalk would have to go in front of the Design Review Committee. And this does open the tax credits which is one of the striving reasons that the person who initiated it.

Mrs. Ludwig said that makes sense. I mean, it's got so much history, so many great stories, so much photographic evidence, so much.....I mean, I think that section of Broadway is probably one of the best documented places in the entire City so.....

Chairman Miller said yeah, I appreciate that your documentation and this proposed district includes examples of, I think, Minott and Malmer and Elmslie in this district. I actually appreciate including the modern building at the southern end, which I think is

now Jill's office building.

Ms. Olafson said yes, I love that building. But I'm a modernist, so.....

Chairman Miller said yeah, many of us are probably here because we like things that are a bit older, but I do like that building. It's very, the proportions of it are all correct, very classy. It's old enough that I think this type of mid-century architecture is now at the age, a lot of it is being torn down.

Ms. Olafson said yes, so suffice to say that....

Chairman Miller said so, any recognition we could give it would help.

Ms. Olafson said and that's what the State thought too and that's why they extended it, because originally we had stopped at Downer, and then when they walked through they were like "oh no, we've got to include that building." Then, of course, we've got the Flat Iron Building too, it makes perfect sense because those are 2 solid anchors at the southern border.

Chairman Miller said I'm glad to see both those included.

Ms. Olafson said great, thanks.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, it does capture the continuity of the commercial district there from 1960. There's no more span of time from that at the end of 1960 to the buildings in the 20s as the earlier ones from the buildings, the 20s. So, when we're looking at the ones from the 20s, it looks like an old building. Well, there's as much of a time gap between that and the first buildings there so I think that we look at the old, that is new, but it's not really that new in the scale of the surroundings.

Ms. Olafson said right, in the scale of the surroundings, yeah.

Mr. Hoffman said so, I think that's good. Have you seen the original front entry pictures of the Aurora National Bank building?

Ms. Olafson said yes.

Mr. Hoffman said I was astounded when I saw the original entry.

Ms. Olafson said oh, that was beautiful.

Mr. Hoffman said I always thought that building looked a little blank and now I see why.

Mr. Signorelli said do we think at some time does the Commission feel that we should maybe go ahead and do the local designation for this district as well?

Chairman Miller said is there a redundancy with the FoxWalk?

Mrs. Morgan said I think it's redundant with the FoxWalk, yeah.

Mr. Hoffman said who's the sponsor or the.....

Ms. Olafson said the client? Harish.

Mrs. Morgan said Hobbs. The guy who did Hobbs.

Mr. Hoffman said okay. So, is this the developer who's working on properties in....

Ms. Olafson said yes, yes.

Mr. Hoffman said and is the City involved with that, support it, or neutral? Not involved?

Mrs. Morgan said for the nomination?

Mr. Hoffman said yeah.

Mrs. Morgan said I think the City supports it. I know some of my Public Works were worried that it was going to impact their streetscapes, because we're doing some changes in widening, in turn lanes along Broadway, but I'm trying to tell them that yeah, it's not going to change it, they're not going to try to make you take it back to the 1900s.

Ms. Olafson said it has no impact on street or traffic changes.

Mr. Hoffman said because it's from the surface of the façade back. Anything in front falls under the other....okay. It seems like this goes well with this planned redevelopment on Broadway with the streets. I know that's been in talks for a while. I think there's some contracts out for at least some of the design work on that so that's coming in the next....

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, soon, that's why they're a little worried. We're already pretty far along in the design.

Mrs. Ludwig said I think it would behoove them though, because I know they're trying to make it more walkable and make the traffic better, you know, things like that. So, I have those original buildings kept the way they are as part of the.....

Ms. Olafson and what we thought happened, we did a district in Champaign as well, and it was the client who brought us in, they owned 3 properties and they were trying to get them individually listed and when I went down there I went this really should be a district. And so, they convinced another person who had properties in there to join forces and then the City of Champaign joined forces, and then all of a sudden now what they're seeing is everyone's redoing their buildings. It, because it really does have a snowball effect. It's like the beautification encourages the next person to do it and encourages the next person to do it.

Chairman Miller said okay.

Ms. Olafson said we've seen that response with other districts.

Mr. Hoffman said and then it gives building owners or developers who aren't in the front of it here now, it opens up the tax credit options for them even if they weren't seeking it.

Ms. Olafson said right. Well, for one example, the Hotel Arthur would never have been renovated without tax credits.

Chairman Miller said oh, so, is that the one that's individually listed?

Mrs. Morgan said the Terminal.

Ms. Olafson said yes.

Chairman Miller said okay, so they got the tax credit, yeah. There's an example of what it can do. I think I'd heard for (inaudible) building they get at least 70 years. Something like that.

Ms. Olafson said pardon?

Chairman Miller said I think I heard the upper floors of that building had been vacant at least 70 years.

Ms. Olafson said Arthur?

Chairman Miller said yeah.

Ms. Olafson said oh, wow.

Chairman Miller said so something's finally getting done. Thank you for bringing this. Are there any further questions for the presenter? Okay. Then thank you.

Ms. Olafson said thank you. So, if we could get a letter of support to the State just saying you back the idea.

Chairman Miller said okay. Yeah, and then, can we do a motion to back a letter for support? Does that give you what you need, Jill?

Mrs. Morgan said mmmhmm.

Chairman Miller said okay, could someone make a motion to support the nomination for National Register nomination?

A motion was made by Mr. Signorelli, seconded by Mrs. Ludwig, that the nomination be approved and a letter given. The motion carried.

[21-0884](#)

Certificate of Appropriateness to allow two years to correct the violation of one vinyl window in the gable end at 465 Pennsylvania Avenue (Daniel & Raquel Vargas - 21-0884 / AU21/2-21.313-COA/HP - JM - Ward 6)

This COA was continued- owner not present

22-0632

Certificate of Appropriateness to allow substitute material instead of wood for the Doric columns and Victorian style balusters at 356 West Park Avenue (Daniel Brito Severino- 22-0632 - AU21/2-22.249-COA/HP - Ward 6)

Mrs. Morgan said so, this item we discussed it a couple of months ago. It was a violation. Let me go through, the owner had submitted some changes. I can turn it over to him as well. So, this is where they started to take down some of the original columns of the front and they removed the floor so we were working, I worked with the owner and submitted some ideas about changing the flooring, making sure the band is one, steps are one, maybe a change to the balusters and not so much of the spindle

Victorian look given this was the Victorian age but the porch was really more of a Classical look as well as more of a simple baluster and then working with some ideas for the columns that still have a tapered column but to use fiberglass. Fiberglass is really kind of the main reason we came before the Commission since it's not original. I can kind of go through some of his comments. You know, once any of the details we can also he can work out them with staff so he doesn't have to have every single thing ready at this point, but just kind of the idea to work through the details with me. It's just kind of more getting the fiberglass column.

Mr. Severino said hello again.

Chairman Miller said thank you for coming. If you could just state your name and your address for the record, please.

Mr. Severino said my name is Daniel Severino and my address is 356 West Park Av. So, thank you again for your time. Last time I was here, you guys were super, super kind and gave me a bunch of feedback on what should be done, what could be done, and how it should be done and like I told you before, I have very, very little knowledge on what other details and what other things should be considered. With the tremendous help from Jill, who's been providing me feedback based on what we tried to do here and how it didn't really agree, I want to propose a few different things on how to maybe do it better. So, here, for example, one of the items is that the floor is, the wood is not supposed to really run in this direction, and it is supposed to be tongue and groove. And so I'm proposing, based on you guys' advice and Jill's advice is that we use this type of wood here which has got the tongue in the groove and so it would basically be removing the floor that we have right now and laying this out in the proper direction, which I think is parallel to the doorway. Does that sound okay?

Chairman Miller said yeah, probably perpendicular to your front door?

Mr. Severino said yes.

Mr. Hoffman yeah, in the short direction, yeah that's correct.

Mr. Severino said cool, thank you. So, I provided the link if you guys want to review it later where it says 1 x 4 tongue and groove, that's going to take you to that specific piece of wood.

Chairman Miller said okay.

Mr. Severino said the other item that we discussed last time, as Jill correctly pointed it out, is that this is supposed to be one single piece of wood and we didn't really have good pictures before, so we're looking at it and we weren't really sure about what we were looking at. It is one single piece of wood, but it was tried, the attempt there was to cover it that it looked a little nicer. So, you can see it's one piece of wood, however the flooring is supposed to stick out by, I think, one inch and it's supposed to be tapered so we will make sure to do that whenever we do the new floor. According to the direction, we will replace, we will remove this piece of wood that's got the grooves in there so that you see it's one single piece of wood like it used to be. Cool? The next item is the staircase. So, the staircase will be redone completely because you will see in other pictures that I have and other slides when it was done, the reason why we redid it was because the other one was really, really bad, in really bad condition. But they made it thinner, for some reason, instead of it being as wide as it was before which is supposed to go from one column to the next column. And so it will be done to be of

the dimensions of the previous one and instead of being 2 pieces of wood as you can see here....so, we'll use this type of wood that we're proposing down here and we'll make sure that instead of it being flush with the riser that it also sticks out by 1 inch and it's also tapered. Then, for the balusters, like I mentioned before, it was very difficult for me to pick one and so Jill, Miss Morgan.....she proposed from this website, which you had also recommended, the American Porch, and so the Victorian actually, yes, that's the one that's most similar to what we had before. It looks really, really, really, really nice. The only difference is, as you can see, this little....I don't know what you want to call it....this little detail on top where on the other one it's flush. But on the thickness and as it tapers up, it's the one that's most similar out of all the ones that I found here and in Menards. So, we'll use those and make sure that base the spacing based on the previous picture because we were also thinking so, okay how's these whatever inches we'll just match what was there before.

Mr. Hoffman said I believe on the side porch on Locust, that's still remaining.

Mr. Severino said that's still there.

Mr. Hoffman said so you guys can follow that. The other dimension to pay attention to is the height. Because those are shorter than the standard 36 inches now.

Mrs. Morgan said I can waive that height requirement for building code so to match the.... because this is going to be a shorter height than what code requirement is.

Mr. Severino said okay, thank you.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, so since you have that one on...that's still remaining, as I understand, what was originally on the front here that's been trashed to be disposed.

Mr. Severino said it was. Actually, I wanted to.... whenever we finish talking about this one, I wanted to ask you the porch on the other side; it's in really bad quality so I don't even know how to approach it. As I'm thinking about restoring it or repairing it, I just picture sanding the stuff and it just falling off so I, I mean.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, we can bring you through (inaudible) to copy exactly the dimensions. Match the height, the spacing, you're good.

Mr. Severino said and then the other aspect that we want to make sure that we conserve is the balusters...I'm sorry...is the don't tell me, don't tell me, don't tell me....the newel posts.

Chairman Miller said you got it (laughing).

Mr. Severino said spiniel?

Chairman Miller said finial. Yes.

Mr. Severino said so the closest that I found to be all square, it's over here also in American Porch and then they also have the finial available. So, I have a question. Those staircases that the handrails were there, I don't want to replicate that because it really doesn't look that well. So, what do you recommend? Do you recommend that I from that newel post I get the railing in the same fashion as the one that's going to be on the railing on the porch itself? One on the bottom, one on the top, keep going down and then I have 2 more newel posts down there.

Chairman Miller said yes.

Mr. Severino said okay, that's what I was thinking.

Chairman Miller said yeah, we wouldn't want to replicate the metal railing. That would be something that was added later.

Mr. Severino said okay. And then I guess this is the most important topic to discuss because I put a picture here from the other porch, the one on Locust, this is the type of the column so you can see that the grooves....

Mr. Hoffman said the fluting.

Mr. Severino said the fluting, yes. It doesn't go all the way down and I remember you mentioned something like it may have been the house of one architect or designer from back in the day who liked to do off book things and so I'm very, very lucky to have one of those. I searched everywhere and I can't find them, they go all the way down. So, that's one aspect of those and the other aspect is the fact that these would be the ones that we found that were used by this other address over here, would be fiberglass wraps. And so they would wrap around a column that is strong enough to take the weight of ceiling and the conversation here, I remember you mentioned we might start seeing these types of requests as we have aging columns that can be really replaced for the actual thing and so maybe this is in a case that's just this one for the house here and then for my house but that you might start seeing a wider request for. So, this one's maybe something where we've got to pause and park and discuss how we should approach it.

Mr. Hoffman said I think the, yeah, in the partial fluting is uncommon if you look at other porches in the area. There are some that have full length fluting that's not out of character. The more of a concern that I see with this, the example given here is it looks like it's a relatively straight, it's a relatively straight profile where if you look at your original ones, and you can, you're fortunate to still have the ones on the other side. I think they also have the half column pilasters against the house which are just long cut in half so you can measure those. You can measure the diameter up at the top and then at the bottom they have a pretty graceful taper....

Mr. Severino said these are tapered. They're brown fluted tapered, I don't know what the measure of the bottom and of the top is, I can definitely....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, that would be something to verify. Even for myself, I think that's the most critical dimension. From a distance the fluting at the bottom there is a more minor detail, but the overall profile, that stands out. And the more modern ones are typically...they may have some tapered but it's much less and that does stand out in the overall silhouette. The little block here.

Mr. Severino said I can measure not only from those halves but actually get a raise or a diameter from the ones from (inaudible).

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, yup. And if the seller that you're looking at here doesn't have it on their listing, that's probably something they can provide you if you contact them, they should get you drawings or sketches of the dimensions.

Mr. Severino said they have actually really good sketches so I wouldn't be surprised to

find the information there. They have all sorts of schematics, again, way over my head so I really wasn't, you know, I didn't know if that was going to be relevant or not.

Mr. Hoffman said have you checked the height? Is 8 foot the exact height that you need on your porch?

Mr. Severino said no, but these are all exactly the same, so they have 6, 8, 10, and 12 so I have no doubt that once I get the actual height that they'll carry it. In the extreme case that it's like a 9, they also do custom work.

Mr. Hoffman said okay. If it's within an inch or 2, you can make that up with a little thicker base. There's a limit, you couldn't go a one foot, that wouldn't look right.

Mrs. Ludwig said I've seen that a lot, those little extra platforms to just.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, the little pedestal. I mean, they come with a little standard size one so like if you're an inch or a half an inch under, you can trim that. If you're just a little taller, you can add a little bit of a.....but if they come in 2 foot increments and you're one foot in the middle, then that would be a custom.

Chairman Miller said Jill, do you know if this house on S. View Street that's pictured here, does it have a....are the columns a wrap or are they weight bearing?

Mrs. Morgan said they are weight bearing; I did verify that.

Chairman Miller said okay, I thought they were. Supposed to be a little different, a wrap. Have we allowed like wrap, fiberglass wrap in the district before?

Mrs. Morgan said I don't know of the fiberglass, we've allowed wrap, and your home has a wood wrap.....

Chairman Miller said yeah, some homes I think were always done that way, like the style of mine would've always been, it's wood, but the wood that you see is actually ornamental than there's a weight bearing pole under.

Mrs. Morgan said and we've done some of our other were a padded 2 x 4 and then we'd wrapped it with a wood.

Mr. Hanson said I believe we just approved the work done at Mutual Ground where that was a non-wood wrap around a load bearing beams. I've knocked on a lot of doors up and down the river the last 2 months and the....in talking with folks that have done these similar restorations, it's been approved elsewhere in cities not named Aurora and aesthetically from either 10 feet, from 40 feet, from 100 feet away you just can't tell the difference. So, if it's something that this Commission will consider for future repairs, for future proposed repairs, I think it's a smart way to go. It's hard to find craftsmen and tradesmen that can restore wood that's a hundred years old. It's not difficult to find things that, again, look like it's the real thing, the original thing from 40 feet away.

Mrs. Ludwig said I believe they've come down on cost too, which is nice because I've looked at some that I need to replace and I'm terrified....

Mr. Hanson said and I wish I would've....

Mrs. Ludwig said bowed out of luck pressing it anymore.

Mr. Hanson said gone that route versus spending an arm and a leg to restore the wood for and....I'll be doing it again in 30 years.

Mr. Hoffman said actual profile and dimensions is the critical spirit of the guidelines. It's painted, if it's.... not just the dimensions, the shape, the profile, and it's painted. There's no difference in the appearance.

Mrs. Ludwig said and as long as it doesn't look like plastic or something....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, some of the real cheap ones do look like Barbie house and they rattle when you lean on them. But those are more like the vinyl stuff, that is pretty bad.

Mrs. Morgan said as opposed to fiberglass.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, yeah. Those are actually more rigid, depends a little bit how they're seamed too. Whether they just are snapped together or whether it's.....

Mr. Severino said so I've seen the ones that snap, I've seen the ones that when you bring them together, where they come together, they like a square that they form and then you put something through them....

Mr. Hoffman said okay (inaudible)

Mr. Severino said and that keeps it together. Now, I don't know how you would do that here because you do the wrap, I don't know how you're going to come up from the top to the bottom, no idea. I don't know if it's flexible, I don't know if it's metallic but it's flexible, but it looks like it's going to stay in place with the mechanisms that they offer.

Mr. Signorelli said well, I think that we can go along with the Staff recommendations for conditional approval for a COA.

Mr. Hoffman said and for this side porch on Locust, is that part of this application or is that....

Mr. Severino said it is part of the inspection. It was also found to be in need of repair and/or fixing and so we haven't touched it depending on what ends up to be the best way to do this and the recommendation from Jill has been "please, just try to repair it. Don't replace anything." So, we'll try that way, again, the way that the beams and the railings look, like I said, whenever we try to sand them I think they're going to come off.....I don't know.

Mr. Hoffman said from looking at the pictures, the railings and the balusters....yeah, especially the bottom one, sometimes the balusters will be deteriorated because they soak up a lot of water. The columns, they've got a lot of paint on them, they have 130 years or so of paint on them underneath, except for the very bottom, it's all going to be really good intact wood so I would agree with Jill that everything possible should be repaired. The columns at the bottom, if there is structural rot at the bottom of the columns, it'll be limited to an inch or two and that can be cut off and then a patch piece be installed. Sometimes they call it a Dutchman repair. So, that's something that a restoration carpenter does as part of their daily kind of work, a regular contractor may be not as familiar with that, but I think if they are the original columns, they're generally going to be in good shape, except for the bottom. And you may need to

replace the whole little bottom pedestal.....

Mr. Severino said oh yeah, for sure.

Mr. Hoffman said like that, that's something that can be easily replaced. It's a pretty standard Greek profile that's easy to find and if you get a fiberglass one, I think that would....

Mr. Severino said would that be okay? Would that be acceptable? Because this company, they sell the fiberglass that I saw and one on the top.

Mr. Hoffman said there's a fancier Greek name for that, if I remember in the....

(Inaudible)

Mr. Hoffman said this is one question for Jill. Is the intent to have a separate application, then, for the side porch, a separate permit for that or is that going to be done under the same permit?

Mrs. Morgan said I think it's under the same permit.

Mr. Hoffman said okay.

Mrs. Morgan said as well as the correcting the rear....

Mr. Severino said oh, yes. You.....

Mrs. Morgan said so this is, I think it's really, the baluster is here since this is the side rear. I was even thinking we could do something simple, not necessarily have to make them do the more decorative one from the side, just this little....

Mr. Hoffman said this is unlikely to be the original porch there. This is probably when it was subdivided.

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, so do the just the standard (inaudible) square. I think it was a Victorian turn post before they did this.

Mr. Hoffman said since it's a non-original feature, I think something less stringent...

Mrs. Morgan said and then just have the top and bottom rail.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah.

Chairman Miller said okay, Al mentioned approving a provisional COA, is there a text in one of the.....there's quite a few documents here, not sure if I should open one and see what the Staff proposed.

Mrs. Morgan said so the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Commission specifically was for the material, so it was the "Certificate of Appropriateness to allow substitute material instead of wood for the Doric columns and Victorian balusters at 356 West Park Avenue."

Chairman Miller said okay, so it's just the COA to allow substitute material....

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, the material, the COA was just for the material as that's not

something that's allowed per the guidelines currently and the rest of it will definitely be included in the Staff approval of the permit.

Chairman Miller said okay, so the balusters and the steps and the new flooring that the owner is proposing will actually comply with the guidelines.

Mrs. Morgan says yes.

Mr. Signorelli said here's what I have. That the column be tapered and not the same width the entire length. That the columns on the west elevation should be retained unless Staff determines they are too deteriorated. And 3, that the balusters and newel post be more Classical in design.

Mrs. Morgan said I think that the owner is agreeing to 2 and 3.

Chairman Miller said yeah, I think I would be willing to approve it with what AI just read.

MOTION TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS BASED ON STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS WAS MADE BY: AI Signorelli

MOTION SECONDED BY: Simon Munoz

AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Matt Hanson, Seth Hoffman, Kristin Ludwig, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, AI Signorelli and Mike Walker

NAYS: None

Chairman Miller said thank you so much for coming and presenting to us, listening to all of our comments. I really appreciate it.

Mr. Severino said thanks to Jill. Thank you so much. Good night, see you later.

A motion was made by Mr. Signorelli, seconded by Mr. Munoz, that this agenda item be approved. The motion carried.

22-0738

Certificate of Appropriateness to replace original wood casement windows with new aluminum clad wood windows at 748 Oak Avenue (Diane Mittelhauser- 22-0738- AU15/3-22.273-COA/HP - Ward 6)

This COA was continued. Owner not present.

22-0824

Certificate of Appropriateness to install engineered wood siding to cure the vinyl siding violation at 452 Pennsylvania Avenue (Lucia Sanchez. - 22-0824 / AU21/2-21.092-COA/HP - JM - Ward 6)

Chairman Miller said alright and the next item is, do we have anyone here for 748 Oak Av? So, would it be 452 Pennsylvania Av. Do we have anyone here for that?

Mrs. Morgan said alright, so this has been in violation for a few years now for vinyl siding on the home. The owner today.....you can see some of the pictures. The is of what it was before so you can know that the porch would never have siding on it. I also did have the owner send me to get an idea how finished that enclosed porch was, some interior photos of kind of what it looks like. It's a little more finished than I originally kind of thought. The window has been changed out. I do have one of original doors. So, the owner now is proposing to remove the vinyl siding and since we know that the porch doesn't have original wood siding underneath, there's also photos that

she pulled off some of the Tyvek and it doesn't look like original siding is underneath, some other portions as well that were kind of getting close to that 50% so instead of trying to do 50% new wood on portions since part of the home doesn't have the original wood. She's proposing LP Smart siding and I know we've had this come up to us before and at that time we kind of held off on it. I just went with the Hardie board. It is a material I've wanted to bring back. I do have samples. She wasn't able to get the samples to have some sample of Hardie board and LP that we've seen before. My research shows that LP does come in this smooth siding, or at least it did at one point. I know, because that's an issue, the Hardie. Also, this is not the smooth, that we only approve smooth. I know I was talking to her contractor at one point and you would have to, same with the Hardie, where you would have to have a larger overlay when you lay it then you would do, then what is the standard....how you would standardly, like in new construction, lay LP Smart siding. We've done that with the Hardie as well when they.....

Mr. Hoffman said the Hardie is available in a variety of widths.

Mrs. Morgan said not as small as we need it. The smallest, I think, was 5. And people, when I've, when they've come in they had to, I had to make them.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, okay. Yeah, the traditional is usually on the order if it's 3 ½....usually 3 ½.

Mrs. Morgan said three.

Mr. Hoffman said okay.

Mrs. Morgan said so they did end up overlaying it more than what you.....

Mr. Hoffman said that's what, I've done that before.

Mrs. Morgan said so, that's kind of how it is. Any questions for staff?

Chairman Miller said yeah, is the LP siding, is that sort of a manufactured wood product?

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, so it's an engineered wood product. They kind of take pieces of wood, they heat it up and like, meld it.....

Mr. Hoffman said it's like exterior rated OSB, you can see in the back. Yeah, it's pressed and glued flakes.

Mr. Signorelli said am I understanding correctly, though, that that product cannot be used unless it's determined that 51% of the original is deteriorated beyond repair?

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, same with Hardie. Yeah, and the we were kind of thinking, with this home, it might be close to that 50% with the porch not having it and other areas not having it. She pulled off the Tyvek.....

Mr. Hoffman said so, yeah, the pictures where the siding's removed, it looks like that's down near the bottom, is that on the back?

Ms. Sanchez said it's on the back.

Mr. Hoffman said that's on the back of the house?

Ms. Sanchez said that's the full side. I don't remember because I was not there when they....well, first of all, my name is Lucia Sanchez and I'm the owner. I did not make this decision to take the siding off. I was married and my husband did the deal with the company that came, and you know, did the construction or whatever and they approved by the insurance. I didn't pay that much attention but what I remember, I was not there when they did it, they were there a couple days but I remember the whole side where you see the picture, that whole thing over there doesn't have original wood. That's what we were discussing with Jill last time, like, I know you want me to restore the wood, but we don't have it. And I've been trying to find somebody who can really help me to do this but it is really hard to find contractors to do work with us and I mean, I'm willing to if you guys give me some options and try to get this done. I'm not the only owner but legally I'm the only person on the title or on the mortgage, so I don't have no idea about materials and work and other stuff, so it's just hoping that we can get an agreement and try to move.....

Mr. Hoffman said the reason I ask is because the pictures behind the Tyvek is OSB which we knew replacement, it's unlikely that they would've clad the entire house. I wonder if that was some areas where there was repair. Just for verification, that the sides of the house don't have siding. Also, the style of the house and the era, could've been stucco, especially with the brick wainscot at the bottom. Could be, it does look like there's....it's possible, but it's uncommon that they would strip the siding and if you look at the, around the windows, there's J-channel sitting on top of the original window casings so it's....there's more thickness than I would expect....around the window trim than I would expect if they had stripped it back to the bare sheathing. I'm still not convinced that there isn't some type of original siding, whether it be wood siding or possibly stucco behind it on the sides and maybe this area down at the very bottom in the back was an area that was deteriorated and had some patchwork done and that's why there's new OSB and Tyvek so I don't see enough evidence to conclusively say that there's not.....

Mrs. Ludwig said I don't know what year....

Mr. Hoffman said50% of the....

Mrs. Ludwig said.... what year they did this but, couldn't you ask the contractor?

Ms. Sanchez said what do you mean? Which....

Mr. Hoffman said they probably wouldn't remember if this was a 2-day job from 5 years ago.

Ms. Sanchez said yeah.

Mrs. Ludwig said oh, so they don't keep notes or take pictures?

(laughing)

Mrs. Ludwig said sorry.

Ms. Sanchez said but remember there was aluminum, so we don't know for how long the aluminum was there (inaudible). There's a big chance the wood is there is like 150 years old.

Mr. Signorelli said I could certainly see where stucco would be an appropriate product, and I'm just wondering since that is the case, could it possibly be easier to find a contractor to do stucco and I'm wondering if there could be a price difference between the wood and the stucco.....

Mrs. Ludwig said like in a bad way.....

Mr. Signorelli saidthe stucco might be.....really? You think.....(inaudible)

Mrs. Ludwig said oh yeah.

Mrs. Morgan said I've had trouble with stucco repair. Trying to find.....

Mr. Hoffman said it's a, now it's a real regional thing. I was, depends where you are, we visited some friends in Calgary, Alberta and they live in a new development on the edge of town; half the houses there.....stucco. It's actually pretty traditional. Like stucco on metal lath, not the EIFS fiberglass stuff. That's kind of common around here.

Mrs. Ludwig said around here that's going to be crazy expensive.

Mr. Signorelli said I have no experience...

Mr. Hoffman said right.....so like I say...and then it's a very regional thing. What's interesting up there.....

Mr. Hanson said what's the COA in front of us right now?

Mrs. Morgan said sorry.

Mr. Hoffman so anyway, I don't mean to get off track there but....yeah, here stucco is kind of like very uncommon current trade and if you don't have trades people, it's hard to find. But, if there is stucco behind that existing siding, for most of it, maybe there's some areas that you repaired that too....it could be in generally decent shape and just needs minor patching for the nail holes. It could also be in complete, complete disrepair from the siding work on top of it. Maybe there was some previous deterioration before they resided it, so.....

Mrs. Ludwig said is there any way to get up under there and see what's going on?

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, you just need to pop a few.....

Mrs. Ludwig said instead of ripping it all off?

Mr. Hoffman said you could go into a limited area. You'll need to pop a few of the joints and the vinyl siding. I think we need to see what's underneath the side on the walls there in a more typical area to know what's under there.

Mrs. Morgan said and if was stucco then what do you do with the porch?

Mr. Hoffman said I think a lap siding would be consistent with.....

Mr. Hanson said consistent to what you might think was maybe there? (inaudible)

Mr. Hoffman yeah, if the house was ...if the house was built in....and you'll see some around here; let's say the house is teens or 20s, if someone enclosed the porch 10 years later it wasn't uncommon to do that infill in different material so it wouldn't be original to the construction of the home, but an enclosed porch isn't either. For an enclosed porch within that historical period, a lap siding wouldn't be out of place. Similar to like, additions on a brick house.

Chairman Miller said yeah, my thoughts were if an originally open porch had been enclosed, it probably would've been enclosed with screens or windows that actually filled the space rather than a mixture of window and siding, but I don't know that there's a perfect answer.

Mr. Hoffman said there's some philosophy, preservation philosophy that non-original modifications should intentionally appear different so that it doesn't confuse the historical narrative that it was built as an enclosed porch. So, there's two schools of thought. Some commissions and cities are very strict so if you have an Italianate house and you want to put an addition off the back, they will mandate that it is a drastically different style rather than blending in that it stands....not stands out, but it's distinct so that you're not confused (inaudible.) I looked up the LP smart siding catalog on the website and it does show a smooth profile so, obviously that's a big one because the textured is not, I was going to look to see what lengths but, what widths, but it's available. It's available in smooth and if it is available in a narrow enough lap that you can get the 3 ½ inch review....

Mr. Signorelli said but you said, Jill, you didn't find smooth?

Mrs. Morgan said I just looked at like, Menards, and....

Mr. Hoffman said it's slightly less popular, so it's often....it's not commonly seen in stock but it's an order. Most of the time you can order it anyway, they just don't have samples.

Chairman Miller said so, to answer the question the Petitioner has for us; if we remove the vinyl and find that the siding is either missing or is substantially deteriorated we need to decide whether the LP Smart siding, that I'm holding right here, would be acceptable as a replacement siding. Should it be found that the original siding is 51% missing or deteriorated. Or on the chance that maybe the siding, if we're lucky, most of the siding is there but you just have to put something on the front around the windows because there's just, because there's nothing there, I guess.

Mrs. Ludwig said I was wondering if you just need to go down another layer because I think in the picture that I saw, wasn't it like Tyvek or some insulation or something? That could've been what.....(inaudible).

Chairman Miller said maybe Jill could pull up the picture....

Ms. Sanchez said the house has no insulation at all.

Mr. Hoffman said sometimes they'll put in it's more just....(inaudible). That's OSB.

Mrs. Ludwig said.....(inaudible) it's a couple pictures back, Jill.

Mr. Signorelli said yeah.

Mrs. Ludwig said.....(inaudible)...the house wrap. If you rip under there.....

Mrs. Morgan said well that's where (inaudible).

(Unintelligible talking)

Mr. Hoffman said but that's OSB so that's not the original. Since it's down very near the ground.....

Mrs. Ludwig said.....it's so low, that's.... okay.

Mr. Hoffman said it's possible that that was repaired and....(inaudible)

Mrs. Morgan said because usually when I've seen it, they take the Tyvek and right behind that is the original siding. They don't usually.....

Mrs. Ludwig said that's what I was wondering too.....(inaudible) to rip away a layer.

Mrs. Morgan said yes, they don't usually, they're not usually something behind the Tyvek.....

Mr. Hoffman said sometimes they'll put half inch fan fold foam board.....

Mrs. Morgan said well, yeah but.....

Mr. Hoffman said just for a smooth surface.....

Mrs. Morgan said something so....that's why I thought....

Mr. Hoffman said nobody puts half inch OSB on top of siding and then more siding. Although, sometimes....probably some around here, there's the wood siding and then there was the asphalt composite fake brick stuff or in shingles and then I've seen vinyl put on top of that, so you end up with a siding that's....(laughing).

Mrs. Morgan said so, it sounds like the Commission would want to see a couple more spots have, have her contractor remove, maybe some on the sides to see if it's the same as what is here where you don't have the original siding.

Mr. Hoffman said and that could ultimately be the more cost effective, if there's wood siding right there, it's generally in repairable condition and only some small repairs.... (inaudible).

Mrs. Morgan said and she's having trouble finding contractors.

Mr. Hoffman said but that could be, if there is repairable siding, whether it's wood lap or whether it's stucco on most of the house that could quite likely be cheaper than residing the entire thing in Hardie or.....

Ms. Sanchez said I got somebody else before who used to repair before we opened this. That was not lower than \$10,000 to repair the wood. Not mentioning that it's not, I don't know how much a big portion of the house don't have it, that they have to replace it not to restore it so that's one of the points. And another thing, like, I would like you to consider that the house has no insulation at all. So, this is the only thing that I have

to cover so if I just going to have because before the old siding was aluminum, so now it's going to be repairing the wood supposing that it's there. It's just going to be wood, so you imagine living in that house this brutal winter without anything to cover besides the wood so that's what I would like you to consider to use and I'm willing to find material just to cover and make it the way you want it, but at least with the Hardie or something on top.

Mr. Hoffman said well, this type of siding has to be installed on the base sheathing. It can't, if there is something underneath, you could put on stucco, but it really doesn't work that well. So, if there is something underneath, if there is siding underneath, you would need to remove that to install this anyway. If it needs to be insulated, that needs to be installed in the studs. Either blown-in, blown-in cellulose or it could be blown-in fiberglass, but I would go inside. Anything you put on the outside, some siding manufacturers will try to sell on the energy insulation effects of the siding but this vinyl siding is providing no insulation effect. It's a ventilated system so the air blows through it.

Chairman Miller said yeah, I've heard insulation, my house is wood also, there is insulation that's blown in. I know many other homes in the district don't have the insulation, I know some friends of mine have said their bills actually went down after painting. So, I thought that.....

Mr. Hoffman said if you seal the cracks, yes.

Chairman Miller said is the paint just sealing all the gaps?

Mr. Hoffman said and caulking, caulking joints around windows.

Chairman Miller said yes, and they made sure that they used this very (inaudible) caulk.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, that can. So, for the insulation the best time if you want to add insulation, the best time to do that is when you're doing siding work because they have to drill holes through the outside. So, if you do that while you have the siding off, or while you're doing siding repair, that's the most cost effective time to do that because you don't have to remove or drill holes in the finished siding.

Mrs. Ludwig said so this siding needs to come down either way, she'll at least get to see what it is under there for real. Does she have to, like, if I owned this home I would want to see what's under there and then make a decision on is the wood too far gone to use a Hardie board or is it more cost effective to deal with what's there. But is there any contractor that would work with her? Like, what happens if she takes it down.....

Mr. Hoffman said well, you know you can do a small area.....

Mrs. Ludwig said.....and then needs some time to make a decision, you know?

Mr. Hoffman said I mean.....any contractor who's going to give a realistic price is going to have to look and see what's underneath there.

Mrs. Ludwig said either way.

Mr. Hoffman said either way.

Mrs. Ludwig said okay.

Ms. Sanchez said so, my question is, like, how far do you want them to take the siding....like....

Mr. Hoffman said it just needs to be a small...

Ms. Sanchez said....what a bigger amount do you.....

Mr. Hoffman said just a small, just a small area that's up above that brick, like along the side. And if you check on one side and....if I was a contractor bidding it, I would want to look in a few places enough to get confidence on what's actually behind there. Because if you don't know, you don't know whether you're going to be budgeting for just taking it off, stripping, caulking, painting or whether it's stucco that's collapsing and you've got to strip that off and.....

Mrs. Ludwig said is there an area on one of these pictures you could show her specifically, maybe?

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, Jill, can you maybe pull up a picture of....that on the driveway side. That's probably the easiest there. So, it has to be behind where the porch was.....

Mrs. Ludwig said so, I think it's one more over, Jill. Oh no, do you want....

Mr. Hoffman said because if you look behind where, on the sides where the porch is, it's probably plywood or....actually, because the older pictures there was windows there. So, that's probably new SBs, 2 OSBs.....

Mrs. Ludwig said she's got to go back here somewhere.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, yeah behind....far enough behind where you see the red....

Mrs. Ludwig said(inaudible) there's windows there so it's got to be back here somewhere.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, like there was that joint to the porch, so behind there is original. It's pretty close.....

Mrs. Ludwig said so, yeah so.....that one.....

Mr. Hoffman said....over on the driveway side.

Mrs. Ludwig said oh yeah, on the other one you mean?

Ms. Sanchez said so, when they took the piece of the siding that was where you see the fireplace, the chimney on the left side in the corner. That was when they took the siding....

Mr. Hoffman said that one in back?

Ms. Sanchez said yeah....

Mr. Hoffman said there's some where in the ground there's no brick. Can you flip to

the....

Ms. Sanchez said and there's no brick.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah....

Ms. Sanchez said there was no brick, there was like, corner back.

Mrs. Ludwig said so that was off the ground then.

Ms. Sanchez said yes...

Mr. Hoffman said you can see the....

Ms. Sanchez said that's not close to the porch.

Mr. Hoffman said because if you look on, okay, yeah on this side. So, you see the red, the painted red. That's a stone cap that was on the open porch behind.....

Ms. Sanchez said yeah, when you see the red, that's the porch and this, that is like, it was close when we.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, yeah and this OSB behind there but you can see where it switches to soldier course brick behind the areas there, like between those 2 little windows. If I was a contractor, I would probably go between the 2 little windows. It's short little sections of siding and it's only a couple of nails to pop and you unzip the joint. I would look there.....

Mrs. Ludwig said is that what she's saying he did, basically, on the other side?

Ms. Sanchez said yes.

Mrs. Ludwig said....because it was further back from the chimney.....

Ms. Sanchez said yes, farther back, yes. To the corner....

Mrs. Ludwig saidso away from the porch....

Ms. Sanchez said....at the end of the house.

Mrs. Ludwig said so on that pic....one more that way....there you go. So, where that shrub is, he went under the tree there?

Ms. Sanchez said yes, yes.

Mr. Hoffman said there might be another addition off the back because the picture is....this is done at the very...

Mrs. Ludwig said yeah, that's weird because you could see the soil....

Mr. Hoffman said I bet this....if you look in the driveway, I think there's another enclosed porch off the back. If you zoom in on this....

Mrs. Ludwig said.....that opening you can see the dirt right next to it. So, it looks

like.....

Mr. Hoffman said....and that's, and that looks like a crawlspace then. I bet this was....

Mrs. Ludwig saidmaybe it's (inaudible)

Mr. Hoffman said.....I bet this was an enclosed back porch, so that's another non-original part of the house which wouldn't have original siding.

Mrs. Ludwig said so if he popped off on this side of the chimney where below where that little window....

Ms. Sanchez said wait, this.....

Mrs. Ludwig said....is by your water meter....

Ms. Sanchez said....little red one, that's the part of the porch....

Mrs. Ludwig said oh, I'm sorry.

Ms. Sanchez said....and that's definitely going to be no original siding, that's less possibility.

Mrs. Ludwig said I'm sorry, I thought it ended by the where the water meter is because I see....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, yeah. You see....

Mrs. Ludwig said the (inaudible) right above the water meter, that's not the porch.

Mrs. Morgan said right. All that's open porch, all of that....this and then this would be open porch....

Mr. Hoffman said oh, actually....

Mrs. Morgan said....definitely behind it....

Mr. Hoffman said...yeah, here's the original house coming here, that's porch off the back.

Mrs. Ludwig said oh, yeah. You did see.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, yeah....

Mrs. Ludwig said you just took it in the wrong spot.

Mr. Hoffman said on the last picture showing here, this is another addition off the back. Probably an enclosed porch. This is the back of the house itself. So, this was....wouldn't have had original siding because it's added on.

Ms. Sanchez said how did you....where's the corner of the back of the house? So, what did you want me to do in the front, I'm sorry....so you want me to take it from there to the middle.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, the (inaudible) the driveway between some of those windows there where you're above the brick, the little stood up bricks there. That will be an area that's the original wall of the house. That will tell you what's actually underneath there.

Ms. Sanchez said so if there's original wood over there, you want me to take the whole entire thing, so you're going to base if it's original wood in the middle of the windows, you're going to consider it or you're going to assume that the rest of the house would be good with the original wood?

Mr. Hoffman said you need to check a few areas to confirm that it's all....our guidelines say 50% so.....of the surface area.....

Mrs. Ludwig said (inaudible)....contractor going to check that for you though when he comes out to look at it.

Mrs. Morgan said I guess I was thinking that to have 50% of the whole. If you have to have 50% all new wood at that point, that's why I was thinking if we had, if this rear porch is all going to be new, if the front is going to be new, if there's a back rear porch that would be new wood too. Are you at that point almost as much new wood as you would be perhaps restoring, so at that point would not just make sense to.....

Mrs. Ludwig said that's what I was asking, I think we should give her the option of whatever's more cost efficient at that point, you know. If she ends up with 90% of the wood actually looks pretty good, don't make her rip it off and put up Hardie board if it doesn't look repairable, then let her replace it.

Mrs. Morgan said I guess that's what I was thinking. If you're going to have 50% new anyway, is it at the point, is it worth just doing all?

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, I.....

Mrs. Ludwig said I don't know the cost for....

Mr. Hoffman said I agree (inaudible) the total percent realistically be based on the total area that needs to be sided which would include, could include maybe 20% of the surface area of the house.....newly enclosed, isn't original, so that's what you would base the 50%, but until you know what's underneath there, maybe it's stucco and just needs patching, in which case.....

Mrs. Morgan said but then are you looking at.....

Mr. Hoffman said it would be expensive then too because you really in order to side properly, you have to take the stucco off, putting on top.

Mrs. Ludwig said if I were you, I'd want to know what's under there and then look at my options and figure out what's most cost efficient because I think the knee-jerk reaction is like "oh, that must be the cost, most cost efficient and then we make it new" and it may not be the case once you get under there. Just so before you commit to a contract with somebody, if I were you, I would want to know more about what's under there.

Ms. Sanchez said this is the fourth person that I'm getting there and nobody wants to

deal with the job, so for me it's even harder.....

Mrs. Ludwig said they won't want to look under the siding and.....

Ms. Sanchez said well, as soon as they know this is City historic, they just walk away from me basically, it is what it is so I need to go just keep looking and see who's willing to do what.

Mrs. Ludwig said yeah, it's been hard to get contractors.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, and if they're the kind of contractor that's not interested in doing the work there, then they're not the right contractor.

Ms. Sanchez said so, do you have somebody that you'll recommend me?

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, I think I have a couple more names too with this grant round. I know we....I think I've given you Caliendo. He's busy, Terry is very busy. I think I have maybe a couple more I've gotten from this grant round that might be able to come out and take a look.

Mr. Hoffman said have you talked....so, I....the experienced contractors who know the district and know that kind of work, they are pretty overbooked. Have you talked to them if they have referrals that they could give?

Mrs. Morgan said the people they know, that's an idea.

Mr. Hoffman said the people they know. Like, from like, in my own kind of business, if I'm too busy to do something but I want to help a client or to give them, you know, maintain a good relationship, I am happy to refer them to someone else, you know and that's kind of a character connection.

Mrs. Ludwig said Jill, if you send me an email reminder too....my neighbor, who's in the the Theodore Lake house, he is always having, like, every year, he has the same people out every year and mostly I've seen them doing porch stuff and it's phenomenal work. I don't know that....I don't know that they'd be willing to put up siding but they would probably be more on the restoration side. But they might be....they're really nice guys....they might be willing to at least help her figure out what's under there and provide some direction, so if you send me a reminder, I can ask my neighbor and see if they'd be willing to take a look at least.

Mrs. Morgan said yeah, I can provide you some names that, I don't know if maybe you and I.....

Mrs. Ludwig said (inaudible)....is Vincent and Sons still involved these days?

Mrs. Morgan said I'm sorry, who?

Mrs. Ludwig said Vincent and Sons.

Mrs. Morgan said they really don't do restoration anymore.

Mr. Arnold said they do heating and air.

Chairman Miller no, he's not interested anymore.

Mrs. Ludwig said oh, he's not?

Mrs. Morgan said not really. He'll....some of his old clients he still works for.

Mrs. Ludwig said more porch stuff.

Chairman Miller said and then I'm not sure who the contractor is that did this S. May Street porch.

Mrs. Morgan said I think that might've been sold as well, that company. I think someone told me that.

Chairman Miller said oh, different owner?

Chairman Miller said oh see if they have the same seals or not.

Mrs. Ludwig said we can keep our eyes and ears out at least, if we can find a few more names.

Mr. Signorelli said just to recap and then make sure that I'm understanding; we're suggesting the possibility to, depending on what's underneath the synthetic siding, that it could either be wood or stucco, and if that were the case, then the entire sides of the house, the dormer in the front, all around the windows and the front door, where ever there is a synthetic siding, would be one of those materials.

Mrs. Morgan said correct.

Mrs. Ludwig said unless it's damaged to a point that it needs to be new, in which case we have those alternative options.

Mrs. Morgan said and that's what we're proposing, is to allow the engineered LP Smart siding if after we look a little more it looks like you're at....I would again say, maybe, 50% of the square footage and not (inaudible) 50% of this existing siding.

Chairman Miller said okay. Does that sound like a fair way to calculate it....50% of the entire house? Some of the house may have never had original siding.

Mrs. Morgan said so, if you're looking at 50% new siding anyway at that point all new siding.

Chairman Miller said you could, yeah.....

Mrs. Ludwig said yeah, I would say 50% of the siding, maybe not the square footage of the house because you've got so much of it that's brick.

Mr. Hoffman said you're talking about of the sided area.....

Mrs. Morgan said yes, the sided area.

Mr. Hoffman said the area that requires siding, yes.

Mrs. Ludwig said yes.

Mr. Hoffman said yes, thank you.

Chairman Miller said and we actually had someone here, the person who could present it on the National Register proposal. She said that she's on the Commission in Rockford. We could've asked her if they allow the engineered wood siding. I don't know if other districts have allowed that.

Mrs. Morgan said I haven't seen a lot on it, if they do or not. I know I've definitely been to things where Hardie board is being allowed more. To me, it looks the same. So, I, and if it's a cheaper alternative....

Chairman Miller said it's less expensive than Hardie board....or concrete base product?

Mrs. Morgan said yes, from what I've been seeing, yeah.

Mr. Signorelli said and also the characteristics, it doesn't rot or become bug infested or any of those kinds of things, right?

Mr. Hoffman said I mean, this is...it's an engineered wood. I'm surprised....so, again, another regional thing....Kansas City, this stuff is like more popular than vinyl for new construction. It has been since....I've lived in a 1980s house there....it was actually an older one, sort of like, almost a soft Masonite. Like, you can literally trim it with a utility knife. And when it's kept painted and caulked, this house was 1987, most of it's in pretty good shape. The stuff that's sun exposed and gets more weathering and hasn't been kept up with paint, that stuff just turns to compost but....I think in terms of guidelines, and we even, I think, our guidelines say cement fiber or Hardie board, I think there's some.....

Mrs. Morgan said fibrous cement is what it....

Mr. Hoffman said a fibrous cement....

Chairman Miller said it actually specifies the amount of cement that should be in the mix.

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, and that's rollover from more, yeah, the durability functionally appearance-wise, whether it's fiber cement based or an engineered wood, I don't think that there's really a difference in terms of the intended guidelines.

Chairman Miller said yes, it'd be longevity.

Mrs. Morgan said and I think let that be up to the owner. Okay, so do we want to at least vote on allowance of the engineered wood siding if it appears that more than 50% of the square footage of the siding is going to be new material?

Mrs. Ludwig said yeah, I think so. And then it gives some allowance for, can we give some allowance for time knowing that the state of contractors right now is....

Mrs. Morgan said this is already in administrative hearings, so I would have....our Legal would have to be involved with how much extension of the timeframe. But I can pass it on that the Commission, with the issues of contractors, would recommend allowing more time.

Mrs. Ludwig said as long as there's some kind of consistent, like, demonstration of

attempting to, you know, who you called, who you've tried to call....things like that, I would think that...because some of that's going to be out of her control, you know. Personal opinion, I don't know what you guys think.

Chairman Miller said yeah, except that's....it's out of our control. The timing is a little bit out of our control at this time. And I might be willing to consider the engineered siding if more than 50% is missing or deteriorated, which considered kind of a one-off special situation. This is kind of an uncommon situation.

Mrs. Morgan said because there's so many of the open porches that....

Chairman Miller said yeah, there's the....

Mrs. Morgan said that's been enclosed.

Chairman Miller said it's been difficult to deal with, it's been hard to think about (inaudible) to think of how to fix it. As long as the porch remains the way it is. So, as a one-off I'm not necessarily wanting it as a, what do you call it, a precedent for everyone else to use it. And if we're still maintaining the 50% standard, I think we're following the.....

Mr. Hoffman said yeah, we're not allowing many people to get it anyway.

Chairman Miller said....spirit of that.

Mrs. Ludwig said so, I'm sorry, is there any stipulation about when that vinyl, aluminum, whatever it is siding comes off are those windows going to be replaced on the sides for the porch or (inaudible)

Mrs. Morgan said no (inaudible)

Ms. Sanchez said they're behind it, they're behind there, those the original. I didn't touch.....

Mr. Hoffman said it looks like when they re-sided it.....

Ms. Sanchez said....I didn't touch no windows so when they put the siding, they just covered those things but they're over there.

Mr. Hoffman said oh the....

Ms. Sanchez said they're no problem.

Mr. Hoffman said the windows are still there....

Ms. Sanchez said oh yeah, yes, they're still there...they didn't take everything off, they just put siding on the top.

Chairman Miller said that'll look nicer to have them visible again.

Ms. Sanchez said I'm sorry, I didn't make the decision, okay? (laughing)

Chairman Miller said yeah, I understand. I'm sorry. (laughing)

Mr. Hoffman said well, I would move that we approve the option to fiber cement or engineered wood siding, smooth, and installed at 3 ½ inch reveal or what would be discovered in the original siding there, if more than 50% of the siding covered area of the house is missing or beyond repair.

Mr. Signorelli said would we want to add to the motion to look into getting more time as well?

Mr. Hoffman said is that up to us?

Chairman Miller said I think someone else.

Mrs. Morgan said I think that's not in the Commission's hands.

Chairman Miller but that she, the property owner, has come in and we've had the discussion as evidence of forward motion on the violation. Okay, so was there a motion?

Mr. Hoffman said I think I meant that as a motion, yeah.

MOTION TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS WAS MADE BY:

Seth Hoffman

MOTION SECONDED BY: Al Signorelli

AYES: Justyn Arnold, Fernando Castrejon, Amber Foster, Seth Hoffman, Kristin Ludwig, Dan Miller, Simon Munoz, Al Signorelli and Mike Walker

NAYS: None

A motion was made by Mr. Hoffman, seconded by Mr. Signorelli, that this agenda item be approved. The motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION TO ADJOURN WAS MADE BY: Al Signorelli

MOTION SECONDED BY: Fernando Castrejon

Motion carried.

A motion was made by Mr. Signorelli, seconded by Mr. Castrejon, that this meeting be adjourned. The motion carried by voice vote.

Chairman Miller adjourned the meeting at 8:25 p.m.

VISIT OUR WEB SITE FOR CURRENT AGENDAS:

<https://www.aurora-il.org/AgendaCenter>